



# **NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL**

**MONTEREY, CALIFORNIA**

## **THESIS**

**ITALY'S CARABINIERI AND CONTEMPORARY  
SECURITY CHALLENGES**

by

Michelle Ann Crone

December 2017

Co-Advisors:

David Yost  
Carolyn Halladay

**Approved for public release. Distribution is unlimited.**

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

|  |   |  |   |  |
|--|---|--|---|--|
| <b>REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE</b>   |   |  | <i>Form Approved OMB<br/>No. 0704-0188</i>              |  |
| Public reporting burden for this collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instruction, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden, to Washington headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports, 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington, VA 22202-4302, and to the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reduction Project (0704-0188) Washington, DC 20503.   |   |  |   |  |
| <b>1. AGENCY USE ONLY</b><br>(Leave blank)   |   | <b>2. REPORT DATE</b><br>December 2017                         |   | <b>3. REPORT TYPE AND DATES COVERED</b><br>Master's thesis |
| <b>4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE</b><br>ITALY'S CARABINIERI AND CONTEMPORARY SECURITY CHALLENGES   |   |  | <b>5. FUNDING NUMBERS</b>                               |  |
| <b>6. AUTHOR(S)</b> Michelle A. Crone  |   |  |   |  |
| <b>7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES)</b><br>Naval Postgraduate School<br>Monterey, CA 93943-5000  |   |  | <b>8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER</b>         |  |
| <b>9. SPONSORING /MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES)</b><br>N/A   |   |  | <b>10. SPONSORING / MONITORING AGENCY REPORT NUMBER</b> |  |
| <b>11. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES</b> The views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not reflect the official policy or position of the Department of Defense or the U.S. Government. IRB number ____N/A____.  |   |  |   |  |
| <b>12a. DISTRIBUTION / AVAILABILITY STATEMENT</b><br>Approved for public release. Distribution is unlimited.   |   |  | <b>12b. DISTRIBUTION CODE</b>                           |  |
| <b>13. ABSTRACT (maximum 200 words)</b><br><br>Since its founding in 1814 as a police force in the Kingdom of Sardinia, the Italian Carabinieri has demonstrated success. To meet contemporary security challenges, the Italian Carabinieri has adapted its police and military capacities to address both internal and external threats while working together with the European Gendarmerie Forces (EGF), the European Union (EU), and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO). Because of the magnitude of certain contemporary security challenges, specifically the migrant crisis and organized crime, Italy has continued to struggle with border control due to the country's long coastlines and relatively close proximity to other nations. This thesis highlights the role of the Italian Carabinieri's historical success and analyzes its contributions to EGF, EU, and NATO effectiveness in addressing contemporary security challenges. |   |  |   |  |
| <b>14. SUBJECT TERMS</b><br>Italy, Italian Carabinieri, European Gendarmerie Force, EGF, European Union, EU, North Atlantic Treaty Organization, NATO, migrant crisis, organized crime   |   |  | <b>15. NUMBER OF PAGES</b><br>71                        |  |
|  |   |  | <b>16. PRICE CODE</b>                                   |  |
| <b>17. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF REPORT</b><br>Unclassified   | <b>18. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF THIS PAGE</b><br>Unclassified | <b>19. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF ABSTRACT</b><br>Unclassified | <b>20. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT</b><br>UU                 |  |

NSN 7540-01-280-5500

Standard Form 298 (Rev. 2-89)  
Prescribed by ANSI Std. Z39-18

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

**Approved for public release. Distribution is unlimited.**

**ITALY'S CARABINIERI AND CONTEMPORARY SECURITY CHALLENGES**

Michelle Ann Crone  
Lieutenant, United States Navy  
B.S., University of Tampa, 1998  
M.O.T., Nova Southeastern University, 2000

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the  
requirements for the degree of

**MASTER OF ARTS IN SECURITY STUDIES  
(EUROPE AND EURASIA)**

from the

**NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL  
December 2017**

Approved by: David Yost, Ph.D.  
Co-Advisor

Carolyn Halladay, Ph.D.  
Co-Advisor

Mohammed Hafez, Ph.D.  
Chair, Department of National Security Affairs

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

## **ABSTRACT**

Since its founding in 1814 as a police force in the Kingdom of Sardinia, the Italian Carabinieri has demonstrated success. To meet contemporary security challenges, the Italian Carabinieri has adapted its police and military capacities to address both internal and external threats while working together with the European Gendarmerie Forces (EGF), the European Union (EU), and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO). Because of the magnitude of certain contemporary security challenges, specifically the migrant crisis and organized crime, Italy has continued to struggle with border control due to the country's long coastlines and relatively close proximity to other nations. This thesis highlights the role of the Italian Carabinieri's historical success and analyzes its contributions to EGF, EU, and NATO effectiveness in addressing contemporary security challenges.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|             |   |           |
|-------------|---|-----------|
| <b>I.</b>   | <b>INTRODUCTION.....</b>  | <b>1</b>  |
| A.          | SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS .....  | 1         |
| B.          | LITERATURE REVIEW .....   | 2         |
| C.          | POTENTIAL EXPLANATIONS AND HYPOTHESES .....   | 6         |
| D.          | RESEARCH DESIGN .....   | 8         |
| E.          | THESIS OVERVIEW .....   | 9         |
| <b>II.</b>  | <b>HISTORY .....</b>  | <b>11</b> |
| A.          | ORGANIZATION OF THE CARABINIERI.....  | 15        |
| B.          | PRESENT SECURITY CHALLENGES OF THE<br>CARABINIERI .....   | 17        |
| <b>III.</b> | <b>EUROPEAN GENDARMERIE FORCES, EUROPEAN UNION, AND<br/>NORTH ATLANTIC TREATY ORGANIZATION.....</b> | <b>21</b> |
| A.          | EUROPEAN GENDARMERIE FORCES .....   | 21        |
| B.          | ORGANIZATION AND FUNCTION OF THE EGF .....  | 23        |
| C.          | EUROPEAN UNION.....   | 24        |
| D.          | NORTH ATLANTIC TREATY ORGANIZATION.....   | 26        |
| <b>IV.</b>  | <b>ITALIAN CARABINIERI RESPONSE TO CONTEMPORARY<br/>SECURITY CHALLENGES .....</b>                   | <b>31</b> |
| A.          | ORGANIZED CRIME .....   | 32        |
| B.          | MIGRANT CRISIS .....  | 34        |
| 1.          | The Stance of the EU and NATO .....   | 36        |
| 2.          | The Case of Libya .....   | 38        |
| 3.          | Frontex Joint Operation Triton.....   | 39        |
| <b>V.</b>   | <b>CONCLUSION: SECURITY IMPLICATIONS .....</b>  | <b>45</b> |
| A.          | INSIDE ITALY’S BORDERS .....  | 45        |
| B.          | BORDER CONTROL .....  | 46        |
| C.          | EUROPEAN GENDARMERIE FORCE .....  | 47        |
| D.          | EUROPEAN UNION AND NATO.....  | 47        |
|             | <b>LIST OF REFERENCES .....</b>   | <b>49</b> |
|             | <b>INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST .....</b>  | <b>57</b> |

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

## **LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS**

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| AOR           | Area of Operation  |
| CIA           | Central Intelligence Agency  |
| CC MAR Naples | Allied Maritime Component Command Naples   |
| COMINTMARFOR  | Commander of Italian Maritime Forces   |
| CoESPU        | Center for Stability Police Units  |
| EEC           | European Economic Community  |
| ESCS          | European Coal and Steel Community  |
| EUROGENDFOR   | Multinational Police Force   |
| EGF           | European Gendarmerie Force   |
| EU            | European Union   |
| EUROPOL       | European Union Agency for Law Enforcement  |
| FRONTEX       | European Agency for the Management of Operational Cooperation at the External Borders of the Member States of the European Union |
| JFC Naples    | Allied Joint Force Command in Naples   |
| MFF           | Mediterranean Foresight Forum  |
| MNO           | Mar Nostrum Operation  |
| MSU           | Multinational Specialized Unit   |
| NATO          | North Atlantic Treaty Organization   |
| NDC           | NATO Defense College   |
| OCG           | Organized Crime Group  |
| OECD          | Organization for Economic Co-Operation and Development   |
| RAND          | Research and Development Corporation   |
| SOCTA         | Serious and Organized Threat Assessment  |
| THB           | Trafficking in Human Beings  |
| UN            | United Nations   |
| UNHCR         | UN Refugee Agency  |
| UNSCR         | United Nations Security Council Resolution   |

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

## **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

I would first like to thank my outstanding thesis advisors, Dr. Carolyn Halladay and Dr. David Yost, at Naval Postgraduate School. Without Dr. Halladay's knowledge, patience, guidance, passionate participation, input, and sense of humor I could not have completed both my degree and thesis with confidence. Dr. Yost's in-depth knowledge and commitment, and his perfecting eye helped fine tune and guide my efforts to success.

My gratitude is also extended to Dr. Donald Abenheim, Greta Marlatt, Michele D'Ambrosio, Sue Publicover, Kate Egerton, and Carla Orvis Hunt for their guidance, support, positivity, and encouragement throughout the curriculum and thesis process. I am gratefully indebted for their dedication to me.

Finally, I must express my profound gratitude to my husband and family for providing me with unfailing support and continuous encouragement throughout my years of study and during this research and writing process. This accomplishment would not have been possible without them. Thank you wholeheartedly!

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

## **I. INTRODUCTION**

How can the centuries-old Italian Carabinieri respond to the growing security threats posed by staggering numbers of migrants to Italy's shores, the increase in human trafficking, and the expansion of organized crime across a great scope of activities? How can the organization, together with external policing forces, such as those in the European Gendarmerie Force, expand its regional collaboration to successfully address contemporary security challenges?

### **A. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

The Italian Carabinieri was established in 1814 to provide local police forces within each province in what was then the Kingdom of Sardinia. It has grown into a classic gendarmerie, a national law enforcement agency that, since 2000, has been formally part of the Italian Ministry of Defense. The Carabinieri serves Italy as both a military force and a police force with special duties and prerogatives.<sup>1</sup>

As Italy has evolved over the centuries, the Carabinieri has grown and adapted to emerging security challenges. For example, more than half a million migrants, particularly those fleeing from Africa and the Middle East, entered Italy between 2014 and 2016, as compared to a total of 119,000 in the three previous years<sup>2</sup>—a figure that included the wave of refugees from the 2011 war in Libya. At the same time, perhaps also because of Italy's long coastlines and relative proximity to certain source nations, human trafficking in Italy accounts for 25 percent of the total in the European Union (EU).<sup>3</sup> In the meantime, organized crime in Italy has grown to epic proportions, encompassing money laundering, counterfeiting, corruption, and drug trafficking. In

---

<sup>1</sup> Roy M. Kessler, "Italian: Area Background Information," (master's thesis, Defense Language Institute, 1971).

<sup>2</sup> "Why is Italy Seeing a Record Number of Migrants?" *BBC News*, November 29, 2016, <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-38148110>.

<sup>3</sup> Thomson Reuters, "The Migration Problem in Italy is Getting Completely Out of Control," *Business Insider*, November 15, 2016, <http://www.businessinsider.com/r-as-asylum-seekers-clog-italys-courts-europe-is-no-help-2016-11>.

addition, terrorism poses a growing threat around the world; and it requires vigilant force to monitor, predict, and prevent terrorist activity.<sup>4</sup>

The Italian Carabinieri has limited resources to tackle these security challenges, and it is looking for solutions from cooperation with internal and external police forces. To this end, it has joined the European Gendarmerie Force (EGF) to provide a militarized, multinational force that could be rapidly deployed for crisis management and other specialized missions that typically fall to gendarmeries in the states that have such forces.<sup>5</sup> Italy has looked to the EGF for relief from its policing burden, but the response has not met Italian needs because the EGF serves at the behest of the European Union as well as the member states. Moreover, EGF member states disagree about the nature of EGF missions.<sup>6</sup>

The proposed thesis will investigate the Carabinieri's role and record in contemporary European security challenges. To what extent can the Carabinieri tackle the current and future challenges? To what extent can the EGF become an asset in the region's security framework?

Four secondary questions will be considered in order to answer the research questions. First, what are the Carabinieri's major roles in public security? Second, what internal changes and external support should be pursued by Italy's Carabinieri to address contemporary security challenges? Third, what is Italy's role in the EU and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO)? Lastly, what current security reforms are being initiated to help Italy overcome the burden of the influx of migrants, transnational organized crime, human trafficking, and terrorism?

## **B. LITERATURE REVIEW**

Since the 1990s, changes in internal and external security have prompted analyses of security challenges across international borders. Many studies question the

---

<sup>4</sup> Ibid.

<sup>5</sup> "The Main Tasks of the Military Gendarmerie," Military Gendarmerie, March 9, 2017, <http://zw.wp.mil.pl/en/205.html>.

<sup>6</sup> Marleen Easton, Monica et al. *Blurring Military and Policing Roles*, Hague, Netherlands: Eleven International Publishing, 2010, 15.



effectiveness of current international police operations. This literature review will also discuss the current reform plan, the efforts of the growing institutional expansion, and the debates about the potential of the Italian Carabinieri and all European gendarmeries.

According to Hans Hovens, an international researcher with experience in the Royal Military Police and Netherlands Defense Academy, the central question remains: “whether or not the EGF can bridge the public security gap.”<sup>7</sup> Moreover, Hovens explains, “within the framework of peace support operations one will often find an environment in which criminal activities thrive, and public order can be endangered through actions driven by criminal and political motives.”<sup>8</sup> As stated, a viable solution to the internal security threat caused by the public security gap may be the formation of the European Gendarmerie Force to fill the enforcement gap and to restore and maintain law and order with its rapid deployment capabilities.<sup>9</sup> Mehmet Bingol, major of the Turkish Jandarma, agrees that the gendarmeries are an ideal law enforcement institution capable of performing a wide range of duties and tasks.<sup>10</sup> Bingol states, “when threats aimed at destroying a country’s integrity tend to intensify both inside and outside a country’s borders, it becomes essential to provide and protect internal security on the basis of a different perception of security.”<sup>11</sup> Bingol suggests that the EGF’s dynamic and flexible law enforcement capabilities function in both military and civilian ways to respond effectively to complex security challenges—and, perhaps, to change the perception to a more regional consideration.<sup>12</sup>

Margriet Drent et al., experts associated with the Clingendael Institute in the Netherlands, confirm the interrelation of internal and external security, though they still

---

<sup>7</sup> Hans Hovens, “The European Gendarmerie Force: Building the Public Security Gap?” in *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, ed. Johannes Louis Hovens (Koninklijke Marechaussee, 2011), 140.

<sup>8</sup> Ibid., 141.

<sup>9</sup> Ibid.

<sup>10</sup> Mehmet Bingol, “The Need for Gendarmeries in the Years Ahead,” *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, Koninklijke Marechaussee, 184.

<sup>11</sup> Bingol, 184.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid.

attempt to draw a clear distinction.<sup>13</sup> Internal security challenges include protecting public order. External security is described as the “belt of instability” that can affect the internal security tasks and how they are handled by the police and the military.<sup>14</sup> The missing information is how the two categories of security challenges are distinguished for the Italian policing forces to act appropriately and how actors cooperate in, for example, places like Europe and Africa.<sup>15</sup>

B.K. Greener and W.J. Fish, both of Massey University in New Zealand, explain the nature of state borders in continental Europe today and relate it to early gendarmerie policing.<sup>16</sup> The European gendarmeries, despite their differences, are typically organized like military forces with internal structures including a centralized hierarchy, stronger suppression capabilities, and heavier weapons equipment compared to ordinary police forces.<sup>17</sup> Furthermore, Greener and Fish acknowledge how “national, and imperial, governments justified the gendarmes’ presence by their role in order maintenance, especially their repression of bandits and vagrants, and such activity could bring the gendarmes a degree of community acceptance.”<sup>18</sup>

Nicola Conforti, a Carabinieri colonel with extensive experience in the international sector at the General Command of the Carabinieri, examined the security challenges expected in the role of the gendarmerie forces that will be called upon to face these new scenarios.<sup>19</sup> His study illustrates the success of the old-fashioned Italian Carabinieri and how it has modernized to become a hybrid organization since March 2000.<sup>20</sup> According to Conforti, “Since 1855, the Carabinieri Force’s long tradition of participating in humanitarian and peacekeeping operations abroad.” For example,

---

<sup>13</sup> Margriet Drent et al., “The Relationship between External and Internal Security,” 5.

<sup>14</sup> Ibid., 48.

<sup>15</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>16</sup> B. K. Greener, W. J. Fish, *Internal Security and Statebuilding: Aligning Agencies and Functions*, 12.

<sup>17</sup> Ibid., 13.

<sup>18</sup> Ibid., 14.

<sup>19</sup> Nicola Conforti, “The Italian Carabinieri Corps: old traditions for a modern version,” *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, Koninklijke Marechaussee, 227.

<sup>20</sup> Ibid., 228.

Bosnia–Herzegovina’s experience with use of a Multinational Specialized Unit has increased demand for the Carabinieri’s assistance.<sup>21</sup> Conforti also states, due to the increasingly transnational nature of crime and the evolution of modern technologies, the Carabinieri is updating management and operational procedures, along with investing in high-level training to modernize personnel skills.<sup>22</sup>

On the one hand, the Carabinieri has long enjoyed a reputation among the Italian public for discipline and service to the republic’s security. For example, Derek Lutterbeck, a University of Malta professor of international history, published work in recent years on migration and security reform issues in the Euro-Mediterranean region.<sup>23</sup> Lutterbeck analyzed the contradictory developments by comparing the evolution of gendarmerie forces in both Western and non-Western countries over the last three decades.<sup>24</sup> He found that the gendarmerie forces are cooperating more closely because contemporary security challenges, such as international terrorism and transnational organized crime, have internal and external dimensions affecting the convergence of military and police roles.<sup>25</sup> At the same time, certain political developments have contradicted the rise in gendarmeries with calls for their demilitarization or civilianization.<sup>26</sup> Two examples are Austria and Belgium; both countries dissolved their gendarmeries and integrated the personnel into the civilian police.<sup>27</sup>

Some studies agree that EGF are a possible solution to some future security challenges because their capabilities and flexibility exceed those of any other public security or law enforcement organizations.<sup>28</sup> Some studies have expressed high confidence that the EGF offer solutions. For example, Conforti is confident in the value

---

<sup>21</sup> Ibid., 237.

<sup>22</sup> Ibid., 238.

<sup>23</sup> Derek Lutterbeck, “Dr. Derek Lutterbeck,” MEDVAC, University of Malta.

<sup>24</sup> Derek Lutterbeck, *The Paradox of Gendarmeries: Between Expansion, Demilitarization and Dissolution*, (Geneva: DCAF, 2013), 6.

<sup>25</sup> Ibid.

<sup>26</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>27</sup> Ibid., 32.

<sup>28</sup> Marleen Easton et al., *Blurring Military and Policing Roles* (Hague, Netherlands: Eleven International Publishing, 2010), 1.

of modernizing the Italian Carabinieri because of its historical success.<sup>29</sup> Clear documentation is needed to identify the transition from tasks performed under military command to civilian police and solutions in order to fill the logistics gap for a timely rapid deployment of EGF.<sup>30</sup> Lutterbeck addresses the concerns about the dissolution of gendarmeries and the argument that civilian police forces are sufficiently capable as long as they have the equipment needed for their tasks.<sup>31</sup>

The RAND Corporation established the Mediterranean Foresight Forum (MFF) in 2015 “to support the development of comprehensive, integrated civil-military responses to complex regional challenges through a combination of research, scenario-based sensitivity analysis and strategic-level exercises.”<sup>32</sup> The RAND authors’ findings support the widespread view that increased security challenges are a major concern for the European Union and other multinational institutions.<sup>33</sup> The analytical framework of the RAND study assessed challenges such as migration, maritime security, and counterterrorism affecting diplomacy, security, and criminal networks.<sup>34</sup> The findings and observations originating from the Mediterranean region were linked to migration, maritime border control, and terrorism. The diplomatic response, along with the application of all law enforcement, military, and intelligence capabilities, is crucial, but the findings show an inadequate response.<sup>35</sup>

### C. POTENTIAL EXPLANATIONS AND HYPOTHESES

The broader context of Italy’s security challenges and the Carabinieri’s roles can be identified as follows:

---

<sup>29</sup> Nicola Conforti, “The Italian Carabinieri Corps: Old Traditions for a Modern Vision,” in *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, ed. Johannes Louis Hovens (Koninklijke Marechaussee, 2011), 227.

<sup>30</sup> Hovens, “European Gendarmerie Force.” 143.

<sup>31</sup> Lutterbeck, *Paradox*, 56.

<sup>32</sup> Michael McNerney et al., “Cross-Cutting Challenges and Their Implications for the Mediterranean Region,” RAND EUROPE, March 11, 2017.  
[http://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE200/PE222/RAND\\_PE222.pdf](http://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE200/PE222/RAND_PE222.pdf).

<sup>33</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>34</sup> Ibid., 7.

<sup>35</sup> Ibid.

1. Italy's exposed geographical proximity to the countries where the exodus originates has increased the security challenges related to the influx of migrants. Issues of border security, refugees, and human trafficking have spiked with higher numbers of migrants reaching Italy's shores.<sup>36</sup> Italy's share of the burden grew in the last decade with a constant flow of migrants from Libya after the civil war in 2014.<sup>37</sup> The Italian government allows all migrants to claim political asylum and to remain in Italy until their application is accepted or refused. The volume of applications prohibits the authorities from processing the migrants in a timely manner, thereby increasing the demand on the police forces to manage the growing migrant population.<sup>38</sup> Significant improvements in the identification, registration, and reception systems need to be put in place to reduce the waiting time for migrant asylum applications. While doing so, the Italian Carabinieri, in a combined effort with the EU and NATO, need to maintain law and order. The recognized historical development and distinctive features of the EGF can provide organized assistance. The EGF military roles and capability allow extended deployment to Italy in order to address security issues.

2. Why is Italy not satisfied with the EU and NATO contributions? Why do Italians hold that the EU is not providing enough support to address the migrant and asylum seeker crisis? Italy is threatening to withhold Italian contributions to the EU's budget in a retaliatory measure.<sup>39</sup> A possible solution is increased cooperation from the EU and member states to relocate asylum seekers who have reached Italy's borders. The migrant's ability to register in any welcoming country must be replaced with a well-regulated system, and the EU must oblige all EU member states to respect this system.<sup>40</sup> According to Steve Scherer of Reuters, a common migration and asylum policy among

---

<sup>36</sup> "2016 Trafficking in Report," U.S. Department of State, March 10, 2017, <https://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/countries/2016/258790.htm>.

<sup>37</sup> "The Position of Italy in Europe's Migration and Asylum Crisis," Clingendael Netherlands Institute of International Relations, March 10, 2017, <https://www.clingendael.nl/publication/position-italy-europes-migration-and-asylum-crisis>.

<sup>38</sup> Steve Scherer, "The Migration Problem in Italy is Getting Completely Out of Control," *Business Insider*, November 15, 2016, <http://www.businessinsider.com/r-as-asylum-seekers-clog-italys-courts-europe-is-no-help-2016-11>.

<sup>39</sup> Reuters, "Migration Problem," 2.

<sup>40</sup> Ibid.

EU member states is expected to dictate specified measures to increase coordination with national operations and regulate the flow of migrants to Italy.<sup>41</sup>

#### **D. RESEARCH DESIGN**

This thesis undertakes a comparative study examining how the unification of the police forces of several European Union countries can have far reaching implications for the balance of power between civilian and military law enforcement. The comparative study will analyze the roles of the Carabinieri internally and compare these roles to external roles within the EGF. The thesis investigates the hypothesis that the demands of internal roles determine whether the distribution of responsibilities can be equitable when facing these external security challenges. Understanding the past and present roles of the Carabinieri will be vital in assessing prospects for success or failure in meeting today's increased security challenges and ensuring Italy's future stability.

Creating a clear model of how the cases are distributed and handled by the Italian Carabinieri and European Gendarmerie Forces will help to determine the causes of public security gaps and explain why other countries are not participating in European Gendarmerie Forces. Furthermore, the thesis will examine the European Union's current migration policy and investigate why member states are withholding agreement to cooperate to assist Italy in dealing with an overwhelming influx of migrants, thereby flooding Italian police forces with work.

The research will rely on a variety of books and articles published on the subject from the creation of the Italian Carabinieri to the development of the European Gendarmerie Forces and how they function in addressing today's migration crisis and organized crime. Furthermore, resources discussing terrorism and other current and relevant issues will be used to address the Carabinieri's past and present roles and their concerns with the European Union today. The research method relies solely on published studies.

---

<sup>41</sup> Nicolas Farrell, "Welcome to Italy: This is What a Real Immigration Crisis Looks Like," *The Spectator*, June 20, 2015, <http://www.spectator.co.uk/2015/06/the-invasion-of-italy>.

## **E. THESIS OVERVIEW**

The thesis commences its analysis with an overview of Italy's increased security challenges and the roles of the Italian Carabinieri and the European Gendarmerie Forces. Chapter II will illustrate the historical context, providing background on the Carabinieri and leading to their present capabilities and operations. Chapter III will illustrate and examine the organization and function of the EGF, EU, and NATO. Chapter IV will examine the Carabinieri's efforts and responses to the contemporary security challenges, especially the influx of migrants and rise of organized crime. Chapter IV will also determine to what extent the support or lack of it from these organizations is causing the Italian Carabinieri to become overstretched with responsibilities to missions elsewhere, including international deployments and EGF work. Chapter V will summarize conclusions and provide recommendations for the future roles of the Italian Carabinieri, in light of foreseeable security requirements.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK



## II. HISTORY

The Carabinieri originated more than 200 years ago—even before the birth of the modern Italian state—as a force to protect the Italian people locally and during international wars and crises. This chapter will examine the origins and changing roles of the Italian Carabinieri and assess its effectiveness including the adaptation and innovation from the Italian national police forces over time with integrating with other gendarmeries and alongside the Navy, Army, and Air Force as a way to identify how this security force can better face current challenges, including the influx of migrants and organized crime.

The word “Carabinieri” implies a soldier with a rifle called a “carbine” on foot or horseback.<sup>42</sup> The elite formation of the Italian Carabinieri was created by the King of Sardinia, King Victor Emmanuel I, in 1814.<sup>43</sup> They were formed “to watch over public security and to assure the preservation of order and the enforcement of law in the territories of the royal House of Savoy.”<sup>44</sup> The role of the Savoy in the unification of Italy included a strong monarchy and leadership.<sup>45</sup> This period of time was known as Risorgimento, the political unification of Italy which was period to gain independence, the “Carabinieri” were the bodyguards of the King.”<sup>46</sup> As a fighting unit, the Carabinieri earned a reputation for success on the battlefield during the Risorgimento.<sup>47</sup>

Service events of the Carabinieri on the battlefield began with the first action, in Grenoble on July 6, 1815. The Carabinieri division disrupted the French forces charging the army of Napoleon and leading to victory of the battle.<sup>48</sup> During the First War of

---

<sup>42</sup> Roy M. Kessler, “Italian: Area Background Information,” (master’s thesis, Defense Language Institute, 1971).

<sup>43</sup> Ibid., 79.

<sup>44</sup> Ibid.

<sup>45</sup> Sabina Donati, *A Political History of National Citizenship and Identity in Italy, 1861–1950* (California: Stanford University Press, 2013), 16.

<sup>46</sup> Kessler., 79.

<sup>47</sup> Ibid.

<sup>48</sup> “The Carabinieri Force Has Taken Part,” Carabinieri, August 26, 2017, <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/the-carabinieri-force-has-taken-part-43a075ce89034912a7b402c8adb46daf>.

Independence on April 30, 1848, at Pastrengo, the Carabinieri fought against the conservative states and was awarded the first Silver Medal for Military Valour.<sup>49</sup> The Carabinieri also provided intelligence on enemy movement during the Second War of Independence in 1859.<sup>50</sup> In addition, the Carabinieri supported the unity of Italy between 1860 and 1861 by participating in the capture of Perugia with the army unit on September 14, 1869, and were involved in the battle from October 29 to November 4, 1860, near Garigliano and Mola di Gaeta.<sup>51</sup> The Carabinieri separated themselves in 1866 during the Third War of Independence,

they distinguished themselves on 24th June in the defence of the bridge at Monzambano on the Mincio River; in a charge at Mount Croce during the battle of Custoza; from 6th to 18th July in the siege of Austrian Forts of Motteggiana, Bocca di Ganda, Rocchetta and Centrale (Mantova); and finally in battle from 6th to 22nd July in Condino (Tento) and Primolano (Cicenza).<sup>52</sup>

Furthermore, in 1870, they participated in annexation of Rome campaign and continued their involvement with the century.<sup>53</sup>

The Carabinieri is recognized as a military policing force for the protection of property, including works of art and archaeological sites.<sup>54</sup> For example, the Gianfranco Becchina raids the Carabinieri recovered illegal items and over 5,000 artifacts from Southern Italy.<sup>55</sup> The Carabinieri also had outstanding officers and programs, along with expertise and unbeatable force capabilities.<sup>56</sup> The Carabinieri “foot soldiers [were]

---

<sup>49</sup> Ibid.

<sup>50</sup> Ibid.

<sup>51</sup> Ibid.

<sup>52</sup> Ibid.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid.

<sup>54</sup> “Carabinieri for the Protection of Cultural Heritage Anti-Counterfeiting,” Ministero Della Difesa, November 1, 2017, <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/english/carabinieri-for-the-protection-of-cultural-heritage-and-anti-counterfeiting>.

<sup>55</sup> Silvia Donati, “Carabinieri Recover Biggest Stolen Archeology Collection in History,” *Italy Magazine*, January 22, 2015, <http://www.italymagazine.com/news/carabinieri-recover-biggest-stolen-archeology-collection-history>.

<sup>56</sup> “The Corps History,” L’Arma de Carabinieri, March 2, 2017, <http://home.mweb.co.za/re/redcap/carahist.htm>.

rigorously selected for their distinguished good conduct and judiciousness, [and their] task was to contribute to the necessary happiness of the State, which cannot be separated from protection and defense of all good subjects.”<sup>57</sup>

The birth of Italy expanded the duty of the Carabinieri from protecting the Italian landscape and art to serving as a fighting force dispersed throughout the territory, with international relations implications. This growth continued

from Piedmont, where they originated, to Lazio where they arrived in 1870, the Carabinieri have assisted generations of Italians, where their attentive and reassuring presence, playing a key role throughout history and its landmark events, from the times of the Sabaudo Kingdom, on through the Kingdom of Italy, the Italian Republic and up to its current international commitments for peace and security.<sup>58</sup>

As an elite corps of the Army, they fought in special combat during the World Wars.<sup>59</sup> In 1915, during World War I, the Carabinieri was set up as two upper echelons in the chain of command—the Interior Ministry and the War Ministry.<sup>60</sup> Its duties in wartime were counterintelligence for the defense of the nation, including control of lines of communication, force protection, and order of battle maintenance.<sup>61</sup> The Great War also influenced changes in Carabinieri coordination and required tools for counterintelligence and prisoner detention facilities.<sup>62</sup> The Carabinieri’s integration with the army and other agencies during World War I demonstrated that it was a reliable and effective force trusted by the public. The Carabinieri intelligence service provided the effective components during the war while the military counterintelligence operations were serving abroad.<sup>63</sup> Although they contributed valuable resources to this great war, “the Carabinieri Corps paid a dramatic toll (1,423 dead and 5,245 wounded) for their

---

<sup>57</sup> Ibid.

<sup>58</sup> “The History,” Carabinieri, October 09, 2017, <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/english/the-history>.

<sup>59</sup> Kessler., 80.

<sup>60</sup> Ibid.

<sup>61</sup> Ibid.

<sup>62</sup> Ibid.

<sup>63</sup> Ibid.

heroism on various battlefields of the Great War: Podgora, Isonzo, Carso, Piave, Sabotino, and San Michele. For bravery, self-sacrifice and commitment to the duty demonstrated, on June 5, 1920, a milestone in the Corps history, the Carabinieri Colours were awarded the first Gold Medal of Military Valour.”<sup>64</sup> With the success in battles, the Carabinieri received the highest praise and was recognized before any other Italian organization.<sup>65</sup> World War I resulted in the Carabinieri’s distinguished separation from the Italian military by showing extraordinary results while carrying out its orders and duties.

During the Benito Mussolini fascist regime reign (1922–1943), “the Carabinieri were one of the police forces entrusted with suppressing the opposition in Italy. During World War II they fought in their functions as military police against the Allied forces, and against Yugoslav partisans as part of the Italian occupation force in Yugoslavia.”<sup>66</sup> The Carabinieri were also active in all front battles, “from the far off Balkans and Russia to the African deserts... the most outstanding are the battle of Klisura (December 16–30, 1941. Greek-Albanian front) ...and the strong defense of Culqualber (August 6 through November 21, 1941. Ethiopian front).”<sup>67</sup> Although the notable events of the Carabinieri during World War II was being utilized to end opposition with Mussolini, Germans felt spared by the Carabinieri being unfaithful because of fascism.<sup>68</sup> The Carabinieri were arrested, deported, and forced work in labor camps which led many to join the Italian Resistance movement.<sup>69</sup>

The Carabinieri’s role in the downfall of Mussolini was viewed as disloyal to the fascist cause.<sup>70</sup> In 2000, the Italian Carabinieri became the fourth Armed Force of Italy, a

---

<sup>64</sup>“The Corps History,” L’Arma dei Carabinieri, March 2, 2017, <http://home.mweb.co.za/re/redcap/carahist.htm>.

<sup>65</sup> Ibid., 28.

<sup>66</sup> “Carabinieri,” *Constructed Worlds*, August 26, 2017, <http://conworld.wikia.com/wiki/Carabinieri>.

<sup>67</sup> “The Corps History,” L’Arma dei Carabinieri, March 2, 2017, <http://home.mweb.co.za/re/redcap/carahist.htm>.

<sup>68</sup> John Bensalhia, “1814-2015: Carabinieri at 200,” *Italy Magazine*, August 25, 2014, <http://www.italymagazine.com/featured-story/1814-2014-carabinieri-200>.

<sup>69</sup> Ibid.

<sup>70</sup>“Carabinieri,” *Constructed Worlds*, August 26, 2017, <http://conworld.wikia.com/wiki/Carabinieri>.

police force with a military status.<sup>71</sup> The Carabinieri was known for its double identity with its military and police responsibilities, and it functioned as an asset to missions abroad. Its police duties meant that the Carabinieri was also known as the gendarmerie of Italy.<sup>72</sup> The Italian gendarmerie-type force was “an integral part of the Italian armed forces—they constitute the fourth branch, after the army, the navy and the air force—and they been involved in all of the country’s military conflict.”<sup>73</sup>

Today, the standing of the Carabinieri is very important, and they play a major role in peacekeeping, such as missions in Afghanistan, Iraq, and Kosovo.<sup>74</sup> For example, the Carabinieri headquarters in Nasiriyah, Iraq, experienced a suicide attack on November 12, 2003. A tanker truck rigged with explosives killed approximately 28 people, including 13 Italian Carabinieri, four soldiers, and two Italian civilians.<sup>75</sup> This incident was the highest casualty involving Italian soldiers since World War II. One year later, the Carabinieri officially commissioned a Centre of Excellence for Stability Police Units.<sup>76</sup> This would develop the training and doctrinal standards for civilian police units linked to overseas peacekeeping missions.”<sup>77</sup> More than 10 years later, this is still active and assisting the Carabinieri in meeting the contemporary security challenges today.

## **A. ORGANIZATION OF THE CARABINIERI**

Under the law no. 121, dated April 1, 1981, the system “requires a model of coordination and close unified cooperation to obtain the best possible result for all the

---

<sup>71</sup> Maria Gabriella Pasqualini, “The Italian Carabinieri Corps Abroad: Combat and Crowd Control in a Special Professionalism,” *BazHam* (2006), 77.

<sup>72</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>73</sup> Bob Hoogenboom, “Policing the Gap: the Growing Importance of Gendarmerie Forces in Creating National and International Stability,” in *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, ed. Johannes Louis Hovens (Koninklijke Marechaussee, 2011), 101.

<sup>74</sup> John Bensalhia, “1814-2014: Carabinieri at 200,” *Italy Magazine*, August 25, 2014, <http://www.italymagazine.com/featured-story/1814-2014-carabinieri-200>.

<sup>75</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>76</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>77</sup> *Ibid.*

forces concerned and to strengthen each individual component.”<sup>78</sup> The Ministry of Internal Affairs is responsible for public security. The National Committee for Law and Order and the Department of Public Security are used for supervision. The department structure includes the Office for Coordination and Planning of Police Forces, which provides coordination of the technical-operative structure.<sup>79</sup> This office optimized the use of human and economic resources by improving and planning public law and order services.<sup>80</sup> The Carabinieri General Headquarters is “the central organization from where the Commander General of the Carabinieri Force manages, coordinates and controls the activities of the Force with particular emphasis on the following: analysis of crimes and coordinates the operations among its departments; liaison with Ministries, Public Administration Departments and when required with international organizations.”<sup>81</sup> The final decision making is primarily done by the Force Commander General and the Chief of Staff.<sup>82</sup>

The territorial organization relies on the department’s framework structure associated with public policing duties and includes the following: five Inter-Regional Commands with overall control and coordination on regional commands; 19 Regional Commands that manage personnel of the provincial commands; 102 Provincial Commands responsible for the coordination of all Carabinieri units that fight against crime and maintain law and order; 13 Territorial Department Commands that assist in the management functions, coordination and control of the Provincial Commands: five Group Commands, 527 Company Commands, and 69 Lieutenancies responsible for supplying 24-hour service for territory operative problems, and 4,575 Carabinieri Stations responsible directly to control their assigned territory for towns or institutions.<sup>83</sup>

---

<sup>78</sup> “Because of the Pluralistic Nature of Public Law and Order Management,” Ministero Della Difesa, October 09, 2017, <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/organization/general-headquarters>.

<sup>79</sup> Ibid.

<sup>80</sup> Ibid.

<sup>81</sup> “Carabinieri General Headquarters,” Ministero Della Difesa, October 9, 2017, <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/organization/general-headquarters>.

<sup>82</sup> Ibid.

<sup>83</sup> “The Territorial Organization is at the Core of the Institute’s,” Ministero Della Difesa, October 9, 2017, <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/organization/general-headquarters>.

Moreover, the Carabinieri dual role organizations, the Carabinieri Mobile and the Specialized Unit Command, are dedicated to the military activities and highly specialized tasks.<sup>84</sup> All the parts of the Carabinieri's organization work together to support the peace keeping mission of the military, to ensure public law and order for the Italian people, to provide territorial control and border control, and to counter organized crime and terrorism.

## **B. PRESENT SECURITY CHALLENGES OF THE CARABINIERI**

The Carabinieri faces a complex challenge today with the influx of migrants and the increase of organized crime, which has become even greater due to lack of support and cooperation from the EU. Historically, the Carabinieri have been involved in all of Italy's military conflicts because they constitute the fourth branch of Italian armed forces.<sup>85</sup> According to Bob Hoogenboom, "the principal duties of the Carabinieri include combating organized crime and riot control...[and they] are equipped with a broad range of military-style equipment, such as aircraft, armoured vehicles, helicopters, patrol boats, as well as light-infantry weapons."<sup>86</sup>

Although the EGF is able to assist in external security issues, Italy's Carabinieri is concerned with the future of internal security challenges. The number of migrants reaching Italy's shores increased by over a million from 2014 to 2016.<sup>87</sup> Italy has estimated that spending will exceed 4 billion dollars to manage the immigration in 2016, which forced the Italian government's decision to declare a state of emergency in the summer of 2016.<sup>88</sup> Italy's geographic location and current circumstances have attracted migration. According to the *CIA Factbook*, "Italy's long coastline and developed

---

<sup>84</sup> Ibid.

<sup>85</sup> Hoogenboom., 101.

<sup>86</sup> Ibid., 101.

<sup>87</sup> Gabriela Baczyńska, "EU Border Agency Sees 2017 Migrant Arrivals via Libya Same as Last Year," *Reuters*, February 15, 2017, <https://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-europe-migrants-eu/eu-border-agency-sees-2017-migrant-arrivals-via-libya-same-as-last-year-idUKKBN15U1HI>.

<sup>88</sup> Steve Scherer, "The Migration Problem in Italy is Getting Completely Out of Control," *Business Insider*, November 25, 2016, <http://www.businessinsider.com/r-as-asylum-seekers-clog-italys-courts-europe-is-no-help-2016-11>.

economy entices tens of thousands of illegal immigrants from southeastern Europe and northern Africa.”<sup>89</sup> The government incurs significant expenses in managing the influx of migrants with policing and maritime border control. Moreover, the economy suffer from the loss of jobs for Italians when employers hire illegal immigrants for lower wages.<sup>90</sup> Analysts categorize the following four elements: “the transformation of the social world; the ways in which different agencies construct these ‘changes’ as threats; their interests in the competition for budgets, missions and legitimacy; and the way in which political, bureaucratic and media games do or do not construct social change as a political or security problem.”<sup>91</sup> The percentages of crimes within Italy linked to non-Italians have increased, heightening the levels of work for the Carabinieri and the joint task force involving the military.

The Carabinieri’s second challenge is countering the growing levels of organized crime. The Carabinieri is working toward a closer integration with allies and partners, following guidelines from the Ministries of Defense and Internal Affairs. It collaborates with other national military and police organizations to gain intelligence and take action.<sup>92</sup> For instance, in addition to the Carabinieri officers performing civilian tasks in Italy, for example crowd and riot control, the Carabinieri deployment in Kosovo with France to patrol territory, and perform high-risk arrests.<sup>93</sup> Organized crime involves international activities, including drug and human trafficking, illegal weapons, and money laundering. The overwhelming migrant influx requires an increase in international

---

<sup>89</sup> “The World Factbook: Italy,” Central Intelligence Agency, May 2, 2017, <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/>.

<sup>90</sup> Ibid.

<sup>91</sup> Didier Bigo, “Migration and Security,” in Virginie Guiraudon and Christian Joppke, eds., *Controlling a New Migration World* (New York: Routledge, 2001), 1–2.

<sup>92</sup> “Over the Past Ten Years the Traffic of Organized Crime,” Carabinieri, accessed March 6, 2017, <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/over-the-past-ten-years-the-traffic-of-organized-crime-d675dd4325cf45d385597078993d7054>.

<sup>93</sup> Terrence K. Kelley et al., “A Stability Police Force for the United States,” Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation, 2009, 11–12.



collaboration, and legal agreements have not been reinforced after being implemented, leaving gaps in security.<sup>94</sup>

---

<sup>94</sup> Pierrie Gobinet, “The Gendarmerie Alternative: Is There a Case for the Existence of Police Organisations with Military Status in the Twenty-First Century European Security Apparatus?” in *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, ed. Johannes Louis Hovens (Koninklijke Marechaussee, 2011), 38.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

### **III. EUROPEAN GENDARMERIE FORCES, EUROPEAN UNION, AND NORTH ATLANTIC TREATY ORGANIZATION**

To maintain regional stability and increase security, Italy participates within the European Gendarmerie Forces and two primary international frameworks: the European Union and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization. Italy is one of the six original member states of the European Communities and has remained a significant part of the European integration process that seeks to create a unified continent. Although Italy- Russia relationship is unusual for a NATO country, Italy's association plays a role with peacekeeping since Russia can have a compounding effect on NATO. Italy also plays a key role in the European Union, one of the leading international organizations developed following World War II. Italy's security contributions to the European Union framework have been extensive and have required continued development.

Italy's defined aims, objectives, and strategies can help to shape EU policies in specific circumstances. The contemporary security challenges facing Italy, the EGF, EU and NATO as a whole include high levels of organized crime and migration. This chapter examines how contemporary security challenges affect Italy's roles in the EU and NATO frameworks in how the groups address with the Carabinieri the migrant crisis looking at border control, issues after entry, and organized crime. Italy's responses to these challenges will need to evolve in the framework of the EU, NATO, and EGF.

#### **A. EUROPEAN GENDARMERIE FORCES**

The Italian Carabinieri, part of the EGF (also referred to as EUROGENDFOR), is a multinational police force comprised of seven member states: France, Italy, the Netherlands, Poland, Portugal, Romania, and Spain.<sup>95</sup> The member states participate to stabilize areas outside the European Union suffering from crisis and conflict, and contribute to efforts to protect the local population.<sup>96</sup> The EUROGENDFOR also

---

<sup>95</sup> "Members," European Gendarmerie Force, February 28, 2017, <http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/participating-forces/members>.

<sup>96</sup> Ibid.

provides security to the EU area by mitigating threats and risks including migration, organized crime, and terrorism.<sup>97</sup> The overall aim is to strengthen crisis management capacities internationally and contribute to increased development of the Common Security and Defense Policy in accordance with Article 42.3 of the Treaty on European Union, which states that “those Member States which together establish multinational forces may also make them available to common security and defence policy.”<sup>98</sup> The EGF was designed as an integrated police tool intended to function in different theaters to carry out police missions. It began in 1992, when the French National Gendarmerie Director General brought together the French, Italian, and Spanish gendarmeries to share their experience and training. The aim was to develop cooperation between Mediterranean police forces with military status to increase mission success with military and police challenges.<sup>99</sup>

Later, the French Gendarmerie proposed a formal judicial framework for training and information exchanging between the Italian, French, and Spanish gendarmeries.<sup>100</sup> A declaration was signed in 1994 with the aim to improve domestic security by taking action against illegal migration, organized crime, and terrorism in Europe.<sup>101</sup> Success led to opening up the agreement to others, intensifying the cooperation (including Europol, the EU’s law enforcement agency) and improving the law enforcement effectiveness of member states.<sup>102</sup> Further developments and integrated cooperation began in the early 1990s when forces deployed in larger international crises—for example, in the Balkans, Iraq, and Afghanistan—to assist in police operations.<sup>103</sup>

---

<sup>97</sup> Ibid.

<sup>98</sup> “What Is EUROGENDFOR,” European Gendarmerie Force, February 28, 2017, <http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/what-is-eurogendfor>.

<sup>99</sup> Michiel de Weger, *The Potential of the European Gendarmerie Force*, (Netherlands Institute of International Relations: Clingendael, 2009), 8, [https://www.clingendael.org/sites/default/files/pdfs/20090400\\_cscp\\_gendarmerie\\_weger.pdf](https://www.clingendael.org/sites/default/files/pdfs/20090400_cscp_gendarmerie_weger.pdf).

<sup>100</sup> Ibid., 8.

<sup>101</sup> Ibid..

<sup>102</sup> Ibid.

<sup>103</sup> Ibid., 8.

Following years of unofficial integration, the French and Italian defense ministers proposed the EGF idea to the EU in October 2003. An agreement was signed by the defense ministers that was declared fully operational in July 2006.<sup>104</sup> The EGF aims were acknowledged in Article 1 of the treaty, “states that only police forces with military status can participate and that the EGF is meant to perform all police tasks within the scope of international crisis management operations.”<sup>105</sup> The EGF operations will be discussed later in relation to the organization’s structure and functions, including how the Carabinieri benefits from the integration.

## **B. ORGANIZATION AND FUNCTION OF THE EGF**

The EGF structure consists of the following: “a HQ [headquarter], integrated police units (IPU), consisting of approximately 120 persons, for public security and public order management, and specialised units.”<sup>106</sup> These units are designated for “criminal investigation, intelligence, special operations (arrests, observation, VIP close protection), the detection and disposal of explosives, traffic control, border policing or illegal immigration and environmental policing.”<sup>107</sup> According to Michiel de Weger, within the EGF structure, the following tasks are performed:

- carrying out security and public order operations,
- monitoring, advising, mentoring and supervising local police in their day-to-day work, including in criminal investigations,
- public surveillance, traffic regulations, border policing and general intelligence work,
- carrying out criminal investigations, including detecting offenses, tracing offenders and transferring them to the appropriate judicial authorities,

---

<sup>104</sup> Ibid., 12.

<sup>105</sup> Ibid., 16.

<sup>106</sup> Ibid., 17

<sup>107</sup> Ibid., 17.

- protecting people and property and maintaining order in public disturbances,
- training police officers as regards international standards,
- training instructors, particularly through co-operation programmes.<sup>108</sup>

The EGF operations are integrated and decided on a case-by-case basis.<sup>109</sup> The EGF's development was a complex political and bureaucratic process with differences between member states and competition for tasks with civil police and regular military forces.<sup>110</sup> However, the EGF demonstrated success with its first mission in Bosnia-Herzegovina (2007-2010), its contribution to public order after the massive earthquake in Haiti in 2010 that killed 220,000 people, and its mission commitment in Afghanistan to provide training and support to the Resolute Support Mission.<sup>111</sup> Furthermore, the EGF played a key role in the 2014 Central African Republic mission, stabilizing the unstable area of Bangui, and supporting the internal security forces in Mali.<sup>112</sup> According to EUGENDFOR, the peacekeeping efforts of the EGF have already proven to be successful in meeting expectations to fill the security gaps and manage crisis operations.<sup>113</sup>

### **C. EUROPEAN UNION**

The Treaty on European Union entered into force in 1993, with the primary purpose of promoting harmony among the member nations. During the 1950s, the EU's origins trace back to formation between the following: "Belgium, France, Germany, Italy, Luxembourg, and the Netherlands sign the Treaty of Paris establishing the European Coal

---

<sup>108</sup> Ibid., 17.

<sup>109</sup> Ibid., 19.

<sup>110</sup> Ibid., 22.

<sup>111</sup> "EUROGENDFOR Missions in Afghanistan," EUROGENDFOR, accessed March 5, 2017, <http://www.eurogendfor.org/eurogendfor-missions/eurogendfor-afghanistan>.

<sup>112</sup> "EUROGENDFOR Missions in Mali," EUROGENDFOR, accessed March 5, 2017, <http://www.eurogendfor.org/eurogendfor-missions/eurogendfor-mali>.

<sup>113</sup> "The European Gendarmerie Force," EUROGENDFOR, accessed October 11, 2017, <http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/what-is-eurogendfor>.

and Steel Community (ECSC).”<sup>114</sup> Today, the EU has taken a leading role in supporting the United Nations and establishing integration in civil-military crisis management.<sup>115</sup> The European Union has competing goals established by a number of treaties and agreements between European countries in the wake of the Second World War.<sup>116</sup> They favored political progress in support of peace, economic integration, and international governance.<sup>117</sup>

Italy has continued on the whole to strongly favor European political and economic integration. The EU framework was viewed as a vehicle for modernization; however, Italy’s confidence in the EU has diminished since the refugee crisis began in 2014.<sup>118</sup> There have been more than half a million migrants who fled from Africa and Middle East and entered Italy in addition to the 119,000 refugees arriving from Libya in 2011.<sup>119</sup> This flow of migrants is also because of Italy’s open borders, long coastlines, and relative proximity to certain source nations that increase transnational organized crime, human trafficking in Italy accounts for 25 percent of the total in the European Union.<sup>120</sup> Furthermore, according to Reuter’s analytical report, arrivals of refugees (men, women, and children) reached their peak in southern Europe between reports taken between September 2015 and January 2016. Migrants gave their reason to move as persecution and human rights abuse within their countries, mostly Libya.<sup>121</sup> The growing power of the Carabinieri, the Italian gendarmerie force, has been integrated within the EU operations to handle major security challenges. The Carabinieri is used as a military force

---

<sup>114</sup> “History of European Union,” European Union, January 28, 2017, [https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu\\_en](https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu_en).

<sup>115</sup> Ibid.

<sup>116</sup> Ibid.

<sup>117</sup> Desmond Dinan, *Europe Recast: A History of European Union* (Colorado: Rienner Publishers, 2014), 1.

<sup>118</sup> Philip Daniels, “Italy in European Union,” *Economic and Political Weekly* 33, no. 35 (1998): PE107-E112. <http://www.jstor.org.libproxy.nps.edu/stable/4407131>.

<sup>119</sup> Thomas Reuters, “The Migration Problem in Italy is Getting Completely Out of Control,” *Business Insider*, November 15, 2016, <http://www.businessinsider.com/r-as-asylum-seekers-clog-italys-courts-europe-is-no-help-2016-11>, 8.

<sup>120</sup> Ibid.

<sup>121</sup> Ibid., 9.

to conduct law enforcement tasks when crime arises in countries with conflict.<sup>122</sup> The Carabinieri assisted by “the insertion of international military forces may suffice to halt open conflict, separate combatants and begin disarmament...the experience in the Balkans, Afghanistan, and Iraq show that both military and police forces are required for success.”<sup>123</sup> Italian Carabinieri efforts to help within the framework of the EU have, in many ways, addressed the high levels of organized crime and migration across Europe.

#### **D. NORTH ATLANTIC TREATY ORGANIZATION**

The North Atlantic Treaty Organization is a formal alliance of 28 countries in the broad North Atlantic region.<sup>124</sup> NATO’s members promote stability, build trust, and resolve conflict between countries in the North Atlantic area. The NATO Allies collectively support the Alliance’s essential purpose—that is, “to safeguard the freedom and security of all its members by political and military means.”<sup>125</sup> During the Cold War, the countries primarily defended each other from the threat of being taken over by communism. This political and military capacity promotes the values of democracy and boosts cooperation on security and defense issues. The military aspect of NATO is devoted to diplomatic and peaceful resolution of conflict.

NATO’s treaty was founded under the United Nations Charter, with 14 Articles in the Washington Treaty signed in 1949 by twelve founding members.<sup>126</sup> Article 5, which covers mutual defense, states:

The Parties agree that an armed attack against one of more of them in Europe or North America shall be considered an attack against them all and consequently they agree that, if such an armed attack occurs, each of them, in exercise of the right of individual or collective self-defense recognized by Article 51 of the Charter of the United Nations, will assist

---

<sup>122</sup> Terrence K. Kelley et al., “A Stability Police Force for the United States,” (Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 2009), 21.

<sup>123</sup> Ibid., 22.

<sup>124</sup> Kimberly Amado, “What Is NATO? We Need NATO Now More Than Ever,” *The Economist*, January 19, 2017, <https://www.thebalance.com/nato-purpose-history-members-and-alliances-3306116>.

<sup>125</sup> “What Is NATO,” NATO-OTAN, accessed February 28, 2017, <http://www.nato.int/nato-welcome/index.html>.

<sup>126</sup> Ibid.



the Party or Parties so attacked by taking forthwith, individually and in concert with other Parties, such action as it deems necessary, including the use of armed force, to restore and maintain the security of North Atlantic area. Any such armed attack and all measures taken as a result thereof shall immediately be reported to the Security Council. Such measures shall be terminated when the Security Council has taken the measures necessary to restore and maintain international peace and security.<sup>127</sup>

Since 1949, Italy has contributed financial and military support.

Italy has played an essential role in NATO since its creation and has even been called “a driving force” by the Secretary General, Jens Stoltenberg.<sup>128</sup> But the increasing number of crises on Italy’s eastern and southern flanks has shifted threat perceptions and the belief that collective defense is the main task for NATO.<sup>129</sup> Italy’s significant role in reinforcing NATO’s collective defense is projecting strength to southern Allied borders.<sup>130</sup> Italy’s geography will always be linked to NATO, a connection that was confirmed by a NATO assessment of the security challenges in the Mediterranean.<sup>131</sup> A NATO review, which addressed a dialogue between several Allies bordering the Mediterranean countries, acknowledged the strong security links between Europe and the Mediterranean.<sup>132</sup> Created by NATO in 1994, the Mediterranean Dialogue was designed as NATO’s adaption to the security environment during the post-Cold War.<sup>133</sup> The overall aim is to contribute to regional stability, improve mutual understanding, and dispel any false impression about NATO among Dialogue countries.<sup>134</sup> Italy’s participation in the Mediterranean Dialogue and membership in NATO represent a strong national interest in addressing security issues and concerns.

---

<sup>127</sup> Ibid.

<sup>128</sup> “Secretary General in Rome: Italy is a driving force within NATO,” NATO-OTAN, accessed March 1, 2017, [http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news\\_131453.htm](http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news_131453.htm).

<sup>129</sup> Ibid.

<sup>130</sup> Ibid.

<sup>131</sup> Roberto Menotti, “NATO’s Mediterranean Dialogue Initiative: Italian Positions, Interests, Perceptions, and the Implications for Italy-US Relations,” <http://www.nato.int/acad/fellow/97-99/menotti.pdf>.

<sup>132</sup> Ibid.

<sup>133</sup> Ibid.

<sup>134</sup> Ibid.

Italy maintains national interests with other NATO allies and an unusual relation with Russia.<sup>135</sup> Italy and Russia have over the decades developed broad areas of cooperation, such as being trade partners. According to Nadezhda Arbatova, Italy supports “a visa-free travel regime between the EU and Russia,” illustrating trusting diplomatic ties with Russia that other NATO countries do not have.<sup>136</sup> The relationship between Italy and Russia is, in fact, an important factor in the formulation of NATO goals, despite the name-calling by critics. Although Italy and the rest of Europe have looked at Russia with different opinions of Russia’s political and state systems, Italy is one of Russia’s most important partners.<sup>137</sup> Italy supports an open communication line for the increased security concerns that the Europeans have with Russia. However, according to Wertman, in 1982, Enrico Berlinguer, the Italian Communist Party leader, called Italy the “teacher’s pet” and Eugenio Scalfari, editor of *La Repubblica*, said that Italy was “the Bulgaria of NATO.” These critics claimed Italy did not have an independent foreign policy.<sup>138</sup>

In contrast to the criticism, Italy arguably plays an important role in relations and partnership among Europe countries and Mediterranean, as proven by the country’s actions over the past years. In 1982 Michael M. Harrison, an Associate Professor of European Studies, wrote:

At a time when Britain is growing weaker, West Germany is proving to be an unreliable and even duplicitous ally, and France is drawn to a Gallic-Socialist brand of independence, Italy has become an unusually crucial American partner in Europe and the Mediterranean. Enhanced attention to the political and strategic value of a country that usually draws our interest only in crisis and catastrophe is welcome.<sup>139</sup>

---

<sup>135</sup> Riccardo Alcaro, “The Italian Government and the Albright Report on NATO’s New Strategic Concept,” *Istituti Affari Internazionali* (2010): 2.

<sup>136</sup> Nadezhda Arbatova, “Italy, Russia’s Voice in Europe?” Russian/NIS Center, September 2011, <https://www.ifri.org/sites/default/files/atoms/files/ifrirusseitaliearbatovaengsept2011.pdf>.

<sup>137</sup> Ibid.

<sup>138</sup> Douglas A. Wertman, “Italian Foreign Policy in the 1980s: What Kind of Role?” *SAIS Review* 2, no. 4 (1982): 115–125, <https://muse.jhu.edu>.

<sup>139</sup> Harrison quoted in Wertman.

Despite the debate, Italy's relations with Russia play a major role in keeping the peace and staying informed about increased security concerns that NATO allies have regarding Russia.

Overall, Italy's position within NATO is generally viewed as relatively strong and valued. According to the Chairman of the NATO Military Committee, General Petr Pavel, "Italy is a valued ally. You continue to contribute to NATO in many areas for which we are grateful, and your contributions serve as an example to others."<sup>140</sup> Furthermore, he notes that the priority for both the EU and NATO agendas is to achieve closer cooperation in dealing with Mediterranean security challenges.<sup>141</sup>

In 2012, about 9,000 soldiers of the Italian armed forces were serving in NATO missions.<sup>142</sup> Several NATO commands and institutions are located in Italy, such as: Allied Joint Force Command in Naples (JFC Naples), which is responsible for the training mission in Iraq; the Allied Maritime Component Command Naples (CC MAR Naples); the Commander of Italian Maritime Forces (COMINTMARFOR); and the NATO Defense College (NDC) in Rome, as well as the main bases for unmanned aerial vehicles and airbases of Aviano and Ghedi Torre. The NATO bases in Italy played a key military role during the Bosnian and Kosovo crises.<sup>143</sup> The Italians also acted as watchdogs in the Balkans with Italy's aircraft carrier in the Mediterranean for immigration control, logistic support, and military responsibility in the Kosovo crisis.<sup>144</sup> Italy's roles in NATO were and are significant, but the political and economic crises may hinder increased involvement internationally for future plans. In 2007, the Italian Carabinieri contribution in NATO included the NATO<sup>145</sup> Training Mission-Iraq training over 8,000 officers and 100 plus Iraqi Federal Police with the to increase security within

---

<sup>140</sup> "Chairman of the Military Committee Praises Italy's Contribution to NATO," NATO-OTAN, accessed March 1, 2017, [http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news\\_135849.htm?selectedLocale=en](http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news_135849.htm?selectedLocale=en).

<sup>141</sup> Ibid.

<sup>142</sup> Ibid.

<sup>143</sup> Eva Fabrizio, "The Geopolitical Importance of Eastern Europe for the European Union and Italy," *Geographica Slovenica* 34, no. 1 (2001): 91.

<sup>144</sup> Ibid.

<sup>145</sup> "Italian Carabinieri Train Nearly 9000 Members of Iraqi Federal Police," NATO-OTAN, accessed October 12, 2017, [http://www.nato.int/cps/en/SID-9EB8A162-F446F878/natolive/news\\_65939.htm](http://www.nato.int/cps/en/SID-9EB8A162-F446F878/natolive/news_65939.htm).

Iraq.<sup>146</sup> On April 14, 2017, the Italian Carabinieri Commander visited KFOR HQ in Kosovo, maintaining relations, where Italian Carabinieri's primary role is monitoring the situation among KFOR units and a Multinational Specialized Unit (MSU) base in Pristina.<sup>147</sup>

The Italian Carabinieri have a long history in peacekeeping operations, initially as part of the Army, now as a fourth branch of the Italian armed forces, participating in many conflicts involving the EGF, EU, and NATO. They are currently serving as peacekeepers and adapting to the increased security challenges within these organizations by providing riot control, specialized training, and providing high flexible force with MSU, which includes dual tasks of police and military training.<sup>148</sup>

---

<sup>146</sup> "Italian Carabinieri Train Nearly 9000 Members of Iraqi Federal Police," NATO-OTAN, accessed October 12, 2017, [http://www.nato.int/cps/en/SID-9EB8A162-F446F878/natolive/news\\_65939.htm](http://www.nato.int/cps/en/SID-9EB8A162-F446F878/natolive/news_65939.htm).

<sup>147</sup> "Italian Carabinieri Commanding General Visits Kosovo," NATO-OTAN, accessed April 14, 2017, <http://jfcnaples.nato.int/kfor/media-center/archive/news/2017/italian-carabinieri-commanding-general-visits-kosovo>.

<sup>148</sup> Jarrod Krull, "Carabinieri, Faithful Over the Centuries," *SFOR Informer*, April 2004, <http://www.nato.int/sfor/indexinf/170/p07a/t02p07a.htm>.

#### **IV. ITALIAN CARABINIERI RESPONSE TO CONTEMPORARY SECURITY CHALLENGES**

Italy and its security forces, notably the Carabinieri, face such significant contemporary security challenges as the Mediterranean migrant crisis and organized crime. Determining the historical strengths and weaknesses of the Carabinieri and of other European Gendarmerie Forces will assist in identifying solutions to contemporary security challenges. This chapter will address the Italian Carabinieri's solutions to fight these security challenges, as well as its participation in two primary international organizations: the European Union and the North Atlantic Treaty Organization. The EU and NATO assist in maintaining regional stability, and this affects the Carabinieri's security abilities throughout Italy. Lastly, this chapter will examine to what extent the Carabinieri's migration control efforts offer an answer to security issues in Italy and affect the political and economic dimensions of Italy's future.

The many contemporary security challenges that Italy faces in a complex international environment complicate the roles of the Carabinieri and EGF. As Julian Lindley-French observes, "The nature of threats, risks, and challenges, and those forces that generate them require a far broader concept of security and tools necessary to achieve desired end-states."<sup>149</sup> The complexity of contemporary security challenges requires continuous innovations by the Carabinieri and the other EGF. In summary, this chapter examines how the Italian Carabinieri's unique features and its participation in the EU, NATO, and EGF have responded to organized crime and the migrant crisis, including border control and migrant control within Italy's borders.

---

<sup>149</sup> Julian Lindley-French, "The Revolution in Security Affairs: Hard and Soft Security Dynamics in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century." *European Security* 13, no. 1 (2004): 1–15. DOI: 10.1080/09662830490484773.

## A. ORGANIZED CRIME

Organized crime and corruption in Italy are often identified as “Mafia-type crimes.”<sup>150</sup> To better understand how Italy’s Mafia crime problem compares to organized crime in other countries, two types of groups have been defined. The organized criminal group is a visible, structured group of three or more persons committing one or more crimes over a period of time.<sup>151</sup> The Italian organized crime activities related to the Mafia are less visible and under-reported, compared to the other major organized crime groups.<sup>152</sup> While all organized crime groups are driven by economic incentives, “the criminal behaviors associated with Italian Mafias also include: racketeering, extortions, loan-sharking, collection of money, all perpetrated in a stifling atmosphere of total control of the territory and economics, while keeping a low profile.”<sup>153</sup>

Another of Italy’s concerns associated with organized crime is migrant smuggling—a form of criminality that was discussed earlier.<sup>154</sup> The cases of Italy’s organized crime groups—both mafia and other groups—reveal that corruption and organized crime are closely related. The widespread corruption within social, economic, and political circles stems from organized criminal activity in Italy and presents a significant threat to the EU.<sup>155</sup> According to Claire Brolan, “In the absence of practical and legal means in which to leave their country and enter another, refugees are resorting to the questionable aid of people smugglers. The reality is that smugglers are sometimes the only option left for desperate people trying to save their lives.”<sup>156</sup> Furthermore,

---

<sup>150</sup> Philip Gounev and Tihomir Bezlov, “Examining the Links between Organized Crime and Corruption,” European Commission, 2010, [https://ec.europa.eu/homeaffairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/doc\\_centre/crime/docs/study\\_on\\_links\\_between\\_oraganised\\_crime\\_and\\_corruption\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/homeaffairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/doc_centre/crime/docs/study_on_links_between_oraganised_crime_and_corruption_en.pdf).

<sup>151</sup> “Organized Crime and the Legal Economy: The Italian Case,” UNICRI, April 27, 2016, [http://www.unicri.it/in\\_focus/on/Organized\\_Crime\\_Legal\\_Economy](http://www.unicri.it/in_focus/on/Organized_Crime_Legal_Economy)

<sup>152</sup> “Threat Assessment- Italian Organized Crime,” EUROPOL, June 2013, <https://www.europol.europa.eu/publications-documents/threat-assessment-italian-organised-crime>.

<sup>153</sup> Ibid.

<sup>154</sup> Ibid.

<sup>155</sup> Ibid.

<sup>156</sup> Claire Brolan, “Analysis of Human Smuggling Trade and the Protocol Against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Air and Sea (2000) from a Refugee Protection Perspective,” *International Journal of Refugee Law* 14, no. 4 (October 2002): 561.

“UNHCR [UN Refugee Agency] reports, many refugees make use of smugglers ‘either because they have no other means of reaching safety or because they believe it will open up more viable and durable protection methods.’”<sup>157</sup>

Because Italian organized crime operates internationally, the EU as a whole faces a threat. For example, the Camorra, a mafia active in several EU Member States, was identified as one of the most threatening crime groups by EUROPOL.<sup>158</sup> In the EU, the Mafia has highly profitable operations. For example, an arrest in 2012 in Spain involved in excess of one billion euros.<sup>159</sup> According to an unnamed Italian public prosecutor, “Italian OCGs [Organized Crime Groups] today are the only EU economic competitors that suffer the opposite problem of all other entrepreneurs: too much cash money and not enough possibilities of reinvestment.”<sup>160</sup> This perception explains some aspects of the ongoing economic crisis facing the EU: the serious threats of organized crime and corruption are active and real today.

According to the Serious and Organized Threat Assessment (SOCTA), a EUROPOL product, provided to law enforcement and decision-makers about the EU’s serious threats and organized crime, there are over 3,600 organized crime groups (OCGs) including heterogeneous groups that EUROPOL can no longer identify by nationality or ethnicity.<sup>161</sup> The criminal acts include commodity counterfeiting, illicit trade demands, and trafficking in illicit drugs. The development of international trade routes avoiding law enforcement has magnified the serious threat to the EU.<sup>162</sup> The EU multi-annual policy cycle was created to ensure that the EU Member States’ law enforcement agencies have an intelligence-led approach to guide the efforts to attack the major criminal

---

<sup>157</sup> Ibid.

<sup>158</sup> “Threat Assessment- Italian Organized Crime,” EUROPOL, June 2013, <https://www.europol.europa.eu/publications-documents/threat-assessment-italian-organised-crime>.

<sup>159</sup> Ibid.

<sup>160</sup> Ibid.

<sup>161</sup> “EU Serious and Organised Crime Threat Assessment (SOCTA 2013),” EUROPOL, April 29, 2013, <https://www.europol.europa.eu/activities-services/main-reports/eu-serious-and-organised-crime-threat-assessment-socta-2013>.

<sup>162</sup> Ibid.

threats.<sup>163</sup> The growth of criminal activities is an ongoing challenge for the EU and remains a priority today.

Modern challenges, like Italian OCGs, have also involved NATO. NATO needs to keep up with resources and capabilities to protect the safety of the Allies.<sup>164</sup> NATO is aware of the vulnerability to potential threats arising from Italy's border exposure as a main entry point for illegal immigration, which is often related to organized crime and corruption. NATO is working with Italy's security and defense officials to address the increased threats of organized crime.

## **B. MIGRANT CRISIS**

The Mediterranean migrant crisis is requiring more maritime cooperation to deal with issues presented by migrants and refugees.<sup>165</sup> Migrants who have limited possessions and support systems are also vulnerable to blackmail and extortion.<sup>166</sup> The refugees and migrants in the Mediterranean are not entirely new in that historical migration was common.<sup>167</sup> As Michael Charles Pugh has noted, "records are available for the number of legal immigrants, formal asylum seekers, those granted temporary protection status and those formally evacuated from conflict areas,"<sup>168</sup> but the numbers of illegal migrants who are clandestine and avoiding regulation by European state authorities can only be estimated.<sup>169</sup> According to Pugh, "it is impossible, therefore, to provide an accurate of figure of the proportion of Mediterranean refugees and 'illegal'

---

<sup>163</sup> Ibid.

<sup>164</sup> "NATO Summit Guide," NATO-OTAN, July 9, 2016, [http://www.nato.int/nato\\_static\\_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf\\_2016\\_07/20160715\\_1607-Warsaw-Summit-Guide\\_2016\\_ENG.pdf](http://www.nato.int/nato_static_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf_2016_07/20160715_1607-Warsaw-Summit-Guide_2016_ENG.pdf).

<sup>165</sup> Michael Charles Pugh, *Europe's Boat People: Maritime Cooperation in the Mediterranean*, Paris: Institute for Security Studies, Western Union, 2000. <http://www.iss.europa.eu/uploads/media/cp0>, 4.

<sup>166</sup> Ibid., 28.

<sup>167</sup> Ibid., 31.

<sup>168</sup> Ibid.

<sup>169</sup> Ibid.



migrants” who have arrived in Italy and other southern European countries.<sup>170</sup> There can only be an estimate about the magnitude of corresponding security challenges.

Cohen explains further that some migrants who turn into criminal themselves and in some cases, are themselves victims of human trafficking.<sup>171</sup> Trafficking is defined as a “specific form of highly abusive irregular migration involving the exploitation of migrants, generally for profit.”<sup>172</sup> The major goal of the organized criminal groups are economic gain which in human trafficking the profit generally derives from sexual abuse and forced prostitution.<sup>173</sup>

According to Reuters in December 2000, “Italians harbor a deepening fear of foreigners and think immigrants are a direct cause of increase in crime. Nearly a third of Italians say their biggest concern is an increasing number of arrivals on their shores from the outside the EU.”<sup>174</sup> This issue continues to be a security issue in Italy described in a case study done in 2016 by Letizia Palumbo. Palumbo argues that “European countries are increasingly exploring ways in which to influence the demand for services or products involving the use of trafficked persons or for the trafficked persons themselves.”<sup>175</sup> In Italy, this is growing problem with migrant employment in domestic work.<sup>176</sup>

Furthermore, According to the Organization for Economic Co-Operation and Development (OECD), “Italy is the OECD country with the highest concentration of migrant workforce—especially female workforce—in the personal services sector, in particular in domestic care.”<sup>177</sup> Although, there is a gap of knowledge and information with the relation to domestic workers and human trafficking in human beings the Italian

---

<sup>170</sup> Ibid., 32

<sup>171</sup> Ibid., 31.

<sup>172</sup> Ibid.

<sup>173</sup> Ibid.

<sup>174</sup> Ibid.

<sup>175</sup> Letizia Palumbo, “Demand in the Context of Trafficking in Human Beings in the Domestic Work Sector in Italy,” European Commission, June 2016, 1.

<sup>176</sup> Ibid.

<sup>177</sup> Ibid.

population is at high risk with migration security concerns and ability for Italian Carabinieri and the two primary international organizations of NATO and EU to regulate.

## **1. The Stance of the EU and NATO**

The influx of migrants into Europe has heightened the security concerns of the EU, owing to the impact of this population shift on the EU's social, economic, and political future. The two main challenges addressed in recent assessments are the idea of a borderless Europe and a long-term commitment to the Schengen Agreement, which took effect in 1995, enabling free movement.<sup>178</sup> The migrant issue existed before the Schengen Agreement, but the increased terrorist attacks across Europe raised additional security concerns. For example, the 2015 Paris terrorist attack heightened EU concerns, with some calling for tighter border controls to address the safety concerns of allies and to respond to the asylum system strains.<sup>179</sup> The EU struggles to find long-term solutions and cohesiveness among the Member States.

The massive migration has prompted tensions within the EU, specifically inside Italy and Greece, which are leading destination states for migrant flows and represent the most affected EU countries. Since 1999, the EU has been working to create definitive common standards among the member states for migrants and those seeking asylum, but has faced hindering factors as it deals with the crisis.<sup>180</sup>

Before working through the factors that affect asylum seekers, the EU must develop a way to distinguish and define who is an asylum seeker, who is a refugee, and who is simply a migrant seeking better economic opportunities. The terms are occasionally used interchangeably, but the meanings are quite different. The United Nations defines a refugee as someone who is fleeing conflict or persecution, and an asylum seeker is someone who applies for refugee status awaiting approval to stay in a host country.<sup>181</sup> If the refugee application is denied, the person must depart the country

---

<sup>178</sup>“Managing the EU Migration Crisis from Panic to Planning,” accessed October 1, 2107, <http://www.ey.com>.

<sup>179</sup> Ibid.

<sup>180</sup> Ibid., 3.

<sup>181</sup> Ibid., 4.

and may be expelled.<sup>182</sup> There are EU rules to regulate the treatment of these individuals after they are ordered to leave, a circumstance which also creates accountability issues.

The other factors that the EU faces in regulating migration into EU territory include: significant funding gaps to manage the influx of migrants since the economic crisis began; long-term solutions for placement; the difficulty in predicting migration flows; and negative political press coverage.<sup>183</sup> The EU has been working to create new and advanced standards and procedures for asylum applications processing called the Common European Asylum System (CEAS), but unfortunately member states have failed to properly implement the system.<sup>184</sup> Furthermore, since its initiation in 2003, the Dublin Regulation requires refugees seeking asylum to apply where they first arrived in the EU.<sup>185</sup> However, this regulation places burdens on entry-point states, like Greece and Italy, and creates a tension with EU decision-making.<sup>186</sup> Italy and the rest of the EU have agreed to pay Libya's Government of National Accord to keep refugees from arriving in Italy.<sup>187</sup> This new agreement was only initiated on February 3, 2017; therefore its success or failure is undetermined.

Migration is an issue that involves all institutions, including NATO. NATO aids the EU to stabilize Member States and address security challenges caused by migration. For example, NATO provides training and advice to Afghan security services, is involved in building defense capability in other countries, and has increased its presence in the eastern Mediterranean region.<sup>188</sup> NATO conducted Operation Unified Protector in Libya in 2011. It has since then taken control of international forces and has launched necessary

---

<sup>182</sup> Ibid., 6.

<sup>183</sup> Ibid.

<sup>184</sup> Ibid., 9.

<sup>185</sup> Ibid.

<sup>186</sup> Ibid.

<sup>187</sup> Ibid., 15.

<sup>188</sup> "EU-Asia Migration Challenges: Countering People-Smuggling," *European Institute for Asian Studies*, May 10, 2016, [http://www.eias.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/EIAS\\_Event\\_Report\\_EU-Asia\\_Migration\\_Challenges\\_People\\_Smuggling\\_10.05.2016.pdf](http://www.eias.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/EIAS_Event_Report_EU-Asia_Migration_Challenges_People_Smuggling_10.05.2016.pdf)

measures against traffickers trying to cross the Italian borders.<sup>189</sup> The intervention has been less than entirely successful, as Libyans and others continue to flee their troubled homelands.<sup>190</sup>

Italy values NATO's contributions to addressing the migrant crisis. The organization's intervention demonstrated that it can and should help in current and future missions by dealing with security challenges. The complications caused by a deficiency of a common political vision at a regional level have increased tension between NATO and Russia.<sup>191</sup> Nonetheless, Italy requires NATO's assistance in dealing with threats in the eastern and southern flanks.<sup>192</sup>

## **2. The Case of Libya**

The Libyan conflict and fall of their government in 2011 cause evidence that the rise of migration crisis in Italy. According to 2015 "Directorate of Immigration," in Italy, the trend for migrant and asylum seekers have peaked in Italy with highest records coming from Libya and the Italian authorities experiencing great difficulties coping with the situation.<sup>193</sup>

By 2014, the Libyan route, established in 2002, had changed dramatically in that accounted for the most significant number of all detected illegal migrant entries to the EU and deaths at sea with irregular migrants that landed in Italy, according to the Italian Ministry of Interior.<sup>194</sup> The general background was gathered in an EU-funded case study named the "Study on Smuggling of Migrants: Characteristics, Responses and

---

<sup>189</sup> Matthew Fillmore, "Italy, the European Union, and Mediterranean Migrants: Opportunity from Crisis?" (master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2016).

<sup>190</sup> Ibid.

<sup>191</sup> Francesca Monaco and Tommaso De Zan, "Italy and NATO: What Defence?" *Istitu Affari Internazionali* 15, no.26 (December 2015): 2.

<sup>192</sup> Ibid.

<sup>193</sup> Markus Breines, Michael Collyer, Derek Lutterbeck, Cetta Mainwaring, Daniel Mainwaring and Paola Monzini, "A Study on Smuggling of Migrants," *European Commission* (September 2015): 20, [http://www.emn.lv/wp-content/uploads/study\\_on\\_smuggling\\_of\\_migrants\\_final\\_report\\_master\\_091115\\_final\\_pdf.pdf](http://www.emn.lv/wp-content/uploads/study_on_smuggling_of_migrants_final_report_master_091115_final_pdf.pdf).

<sup>194</sup> Ibid., 3.

Cooperation with Third Countries” served to help with the phenomenon of migrant smuggling and policies of five countries.<sup>195</sup>

Italy accounted for the largest number of migrant arrivals from Syria in 2014.<sup>196</sup> Since 2004, a total of 13, 635 irregular migrants landed in Italy has increased to 170,100 in 2014. The Carabinieri were involved with the search and rescue and border control, most significantly assisting in lowering deaths of migrants.<sup>197</sup>

The increased flow of migrants has raised security concerns and increased popular suspicion and hostility immigrants because of the lack of effective regulation.<sup>198</sup> According to Asale Andel-Ajani, “Europe has moved toward more repressive immigration laws and enforcement measures...the intensifying policing of national borders has created state-sanctioned practices of targeting particular immigrant groups, based on race, gender and national origin.”<sup>199</sup> For example, the Mare Nostrum Operation and Frontex’s Operation Triton were specific provisions set up by Italian government to help investigate tasks. The Mare Nostrum Operation allowed Italian forces, including the Carabinieri to safeguard human life, manage human trafficking, and migrant smugglers. The Carabinieri were deployed at Lampedusa operating Light Utility Helicopters controlling migration at sea but has been closed by Italian authority due to cost and reducing their engagement at sea.<sup>200</sup>

### **3. Frontex Joint Operation Triton**

However, the EU launched the Joint Operation Triton in 2014 in its place.<sup>201</sup> The Frontex Joint Operation Triton was launched in Italy on November 2014 with its main

---

<sup>195</sup> Ibid.

<sup>196</sup> Ibid., 4.

<sup>197</sup> Ibid., 6.

<sup>198</sup> Ibid.

<sup>199</sup> Asale Andel-Ajani, “A Question of Dangerous Races?” *SAGE Journal*. London 4, no. 5 (October 2003) New York: 433.

<sup>200</sup> Breines et al., 21.

<sup>201</sup> “How Does Frontex Joint Operation Triton Support Search and Rescue Operations?” European Commission, April 2015, [https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/what-we-do/policies/european-agenda-migration/background-information/docs/frontex\\_triton\\_factsheet\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/what-we-do/policies/european-agenda-migration/background-information/docs/frontex_triton_factsheet_en.pdf).

priorities of search and rescue, along border control and surveillance.<sup>202</sup> Since 2016, a total of 26 EU countries support the Joint Operation Triton by deploying equipment or border guards, assisting Italian authorities registering the migrants upon arrival, and collecting intelligence about smuggling networks that operate on the smuggling routes from Libya or other African countries.<sup>203</sup> According to European Commission, “Frontex does not replace border control activities at the EU’s external borders but it provides additional technical support and border guards to EU countries that face increase migratory pressure.”<sup>204</sup> A step by step support mission by Frontex Joint Operation Triton includes the following:

1. National Border protects sea using aircraft and vessels with the coordination by Frontex.
2. If migrants on ship, crew assesses situation, whether it is emergency or not then transmits all liable information to Maritime Rescue Coordination Center (MRCC), who is managed by the Italian Coast Guard.
3. MRCC coordinates with all involved Frontex vessels. The coordination set-up is maintained by the International Coordination Centre for Triton informing to MRCC of positioning of Frontex Vessels.
4. MRCC may call for commercial vessel assistance based on Automatic Identification System (AIS) or search and rescue military vessel in area.
5. Rescued migrants are brought to Italy.
6. Italian national authorities conduct immigration process. The process includes: fingerprints, identification, and process asylum claims.<sup>205</sup>

---

<sup>202</sup> Ibid.

<sup>203</sup> Ibid.

<sup>204</sup> Ibid.

<sup>205</sup> Ibid.

Frontex participants including vessels and aircraft are under the command of the Italian Ministry of Interior who assist in migrant screening, providing collected information to Italian authorities and Europol to close the gap of how to regulate migrants upon arrival and lessen the security concerns.<sup>206</sup> The Carabinieri carried out activities, including escorting and transferring migrants to local Italian Hotspot locations, a designated area by the Italian Ministry of the Interior, Department for Civil Liberties and Immigration, and Department of Public Security to manage migrants.<sup>207</sup>

As in the United States, many people in Italy see immigrants as largely clandestine or illegal and more predisposed to criminal behavior.<sup>208</sup> Not knowing the disposition of the refugees and migrants entering Italy places the Carabinieri in a position of determining the status of the individual. The inability to determine proper status leads to increased organized crime also affecting the Carabinieri.

The influx of migrants into Europe has heightened the security concerns of the EU, owing to the impact of this population shift on the EU's social, economic, and political future. The two main challenges addressed in recent assessments are the idea of a borderless Europe and a long-term commitment to the Schengen Agreement, which took effect in 1995, enabling free movement.<sup>209</sup> The migrant issue existed before the Schengen Agreement, but the increased terrorist attacks across Europe raised additional security concerns. For example, the 2015 Paris terrorist attack heightened EU concerns, with some calling for tighter border controls to address the safety concerns of allies and to respond to the asylum system strains.<sup>210</sup> The EU struggles to find long-term solutions and cohesiveness among the Member States.

---

<sup>206</sup> Ibid.

<sup>207</sup> IT Hotspots Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs), 2–10.  
[http://www.libertaciviliimmigrazione.dlci.interno.gov.it/sites/default/files/allegati/hotspots\\_sops\\_-\\_english\\_version.pdf](http://www.libertaciviliimmigrazione.dlci.interno.gov.it/sites/default/files/allegati/hotspots_sops_-_english_version.pdf).

<sup>208</sup> Asale Andel-Ajani, "A Question of Dangerous Races?" *SAGE Journal*, London 4, no. 5 (October 2003) New York: 435.

<sup>209</sup> "Managing the EU Migration Crisis from Panic to Planning," EY, accessed October 1, 2107,  
<http://www.ey.com>.

<sup>210</sup> Ibid.

The massive migration has prompted tensions within the EU, specifically inside Italy and Greece, which are leading destination states for migrant flows and represent the most affected EU countries. Since 1999, the EU has been working to create definitive common standards among the member states for migrants and those seeking asylum, but has faced hindering factors as it deals with the crisis.<sup>211</sup>

Before working through the factors that affect asylum seekers, the EU must develop a way to distinguish and define who is an asylum seeker, who is a refugee, and who is simply a migrant seeking better economic opportunities. The terms are sometimes used interchangeably, but the meanings are quite different. The United Nations defines a refugee as someone who is fleeing conflict or persecution, and an asylum seeker is someone who applies for refugee status awaiting approval to stay in a host country.<sup>212</sup> If the refugee application is denied, the person must depart the country and may be expelled.<sup>213</sup> There are EU rules to regulate the treatment of these individuals after they are ordered to leave, a circumstance which also creates accountability issues.

The other factors that the EU faces in regulating migration into EU territory include: significant funding gaps to manage the influx of migrants since the economic crisis began; long-term solutions for placement; the difficulty in predicting migration flows; and negative political press coverage.<sup>214</sup> The EU has been working to create new and advanced standards and procedures for asylum applications processing called the Common European Asylum System (CEAS), but unfortunately member states have failed to properly implement the system.<sup>215</sup> Furthermore, since its initiation in 2003, the Dublin Regulation requires refugees seeking asylum to apply where they first arrived in the EU.<sup>216</sup> However, this regulation places burdens on entry-point states, like Greece and

---

<sup>211</sup> Ibid., 3.

<sup>212</sup> Ibid., 4.

<sup>213</sup> Ibid., 6.

<sup>214</sup> Ibid.

<sup>215</sup> Ibid., 9.

<sup>216</sup> Ibid.



Italy, and creates a tension with EU decision-making.<sup>217</sup> Italy and the rest of the EU have agreed to pay Libya's Government of National Accord to keep refugees from arriving in Italy.<sup>218</sup> This new agreement was only initiated on February 3, 2017; therefore its success or failure is undetermined.

Migration is an issue that involves all institutions, including NATO. NATO aids the EU to stabilize Member States and address security challenges caused by migration. For example, NATO provides training and advice to Afghan security services, is involved in building defense capability in other countries, and has increased its presence in the eastern Mediterranean region.<sup>219</sup> NATO conducted Operation Unified Protector in Libya in 2011. It has since then taken control of international forces and has launched necessary measures against traffickers trying to cross the Italian borders.<sup>220</sup> The intervention has been less than entirely successful, as Libyans and others continue to flee their troubled homelands.<sup>221</sup>

Italy values NATO's contributions to addressing the migrant crisis. The organization's intervention demonstrated that it can and should help in current and future missions by dealing with security challenges. The complications caused by a deficiency of a common political vision at a regional level have increased tension between NATO and Russia.<sup>222</sup> Nonetheless, Italy requires NATO's assistance in dealing with threats in the eastern and southern flanks.<sup>223</sup>

---

<sup>217</sup> Ibid.

<sup>218</sup> Ibid., 15.

<sup>219</sup> "EU-Asia Migration Challenges: Countering People-Smuggling," *European Institute for Asian Studies*, May 10, 2016, [http://www.eias.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/EIAS\\_Event\\_Report\\_EU-Asia\\_Migration\\_Challenges\\_People\\_Smuggling\\_10.05.2016.pdf](http://www.eias.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/EIAS_Event_Report_EU-Asia_Migration_Challenges_People_Smuggling_10.05.2016.pdf).

<sup>220</sup> Matthew Fillmore, "Italy, the European Union, and Mediterranean Migrants: Opportunity from Crisis?" (master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2016).

<sup>221</sup> Ibid.

<sup>222</sup> Francesca Monaco and Tommaso De Zan, "Italy and NATO: What Defence?" *Istitu Affari Internazionali* 15, no.26 (December 2015): 2.

<sup>223</sup> Ibid.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

## **V. CONCLUSION: SECURITY IMPLICATIONS**

The migrant crisis and transnational organized crime are two of the major contemporary security challenges facing Italy. The shortcomings in control and surveillance within and alongside the country's borders have deepened the migration crisis at a time of increased organized crime. The Carabinieri's increased responsibilities with the flow of migrants may be straining its resources, to the detriment of internal security priorities such as training and offering local services. The resources that Italy has dedicated to the European Union's operations, such as Frontex, have demonstrated the need for collaboration. Moreover, cooperation and communication with groups and communities are essential to make progress in addressing increased security challenges.

Based on the available information regarding the past and current operations of the Carabinieri, including its participation within EGF, EU, and NATO activities, the Carabinieri need to improve its communications and role definitions so that all groups understand its dual (police and military) nature and its exact roles. The Carabinieri's history and dual training could be used more effectively by addressing the migrant crisis with enhanced border controls and surveillance inside Italian borders. In addition, the Carabinieri could continue to work together with other national and local Italian police forces dealing with organized crime inside Italy's borders and combine with the EU law enforcement agency (EUROPOL) in acting and communicating more effectively together within Europe. Relationships matter and better communications between the EGF, the EU, and NATO, together with the Italian Carabinieri, will create more liaison links and more effective law enforcement.

### **A. INSIDE ITALY'S BORDERS**

As the migrant crisis has deepened, Italy's frustration has risen due to insufficient cooperation and communication with other European countries. According to Tyler Durden, "Italy has expressed growing frustration and recently anger with Europe's unwillingness to assist with its growing refugee problem which has resulted in nearly

100,000 migrants landing in Italy with an uncertain future.”<sup>224</sup> The Libyan Prime Minister Fayez al-Sarraj agreed only to arms and training by Italy to prevent the illegal migrant flow. The Libyan Foreign Ministry said the effort “may require the presence of some Italian naval vessels to work from Tripoli’s maritime port, for this purpose only.”<sup>225</sup> But Italy’s role would have to be coordinated with the Libyan authorities. According to Durden, 2017 reports show that over 94,000 migrants, a record number, have crossed the Mediterranean to Italy so far this year.<sup>226</sup> This example illustrates the magnitude of the challenge facing the Carabinieri and other Italian state agencies.

## **B. BORDER CONTROL**

Italy’s migrant flux is partly due to the deficiencies of the country’s border controls. This study flow of people causes frustration for Italians as the migrants enter their borders.<sup>227</sup> Reports state that many migrants have been rejected by other EU countries, such as Austria and France.<sup>228</sup> Italy has been the front line. Italy’s lack of support from other EU member countries increases the responsibilities of the Italian national police and military forces. According to Jacopo Barigazzi, Italy’s proposal to other EU member countries that they open their ports was denied for vessels carrying migrants.<sup>229</sup> The Dutch minister for security and justice, Stef Blok, argues, “just opening more ports will not solve the problem by itself.”<sup>230</sup> Meanwhile, Italy is faced with sharing a burden with other EU coastline states and admits that Italian diplomats have little hope for success.<sup>231</sup> The Italian Carabinieri forces, with their police and military

---

<sup>224</sup> Tyler Durden, “European Migrant Crisis Escalates: Italy Impounds German NGO Refugee Ship,” *ZeroHedge*, August 2, 2017, <http://www.zerohedge.com/news/2017-08-02/european-migrant-crisis-escalates-italy-impounds-german-ngo-refugee-ship>

<sup>225</sup> Ibid.

<sup>226</sup> Ibid.

<sup>227</sup> “Police Orders Dozens of Migrants to Move from Milan Station,” *The Local*, May 3, 2017, <https://www.thelocal.it/20170503/dozens-of-migrants-moved-from-milan-station>.

<sup>228</sup> Ibid.

<sup>229</sup> Jacopo Barigazzi, “Germany Rejects Italian Proposal to Open EU Ports to Migrants,” *Politico*, July 6, 2017, <http://www.politico.eu/article/germany-rejects-italian-proposal-to-open-eu-ports-to-migrants/>.

<sup>230</sup> Ibid.

<sup>231</sup> Ibid.

capabilities, are perfect assets to increase hope by extending their presence to assist in border control with their special skills and equipment.

### **C. EUROPEAN GENDARMERIE FORCE**

The European Gendarmerie Force was “born to participate to the stabilization of crisis and conflict areas outside the European Union, where it contributes to the protection of population.”<sup>232</sup> Furthermore, EUROGENDFOR contributes to “the European Union’s area of freedom, security, and justice by mitigating threats and risks such as international terrorism, organized crime, or massive smuggling of migrants.”<sup>233</sup> Countries are not working together to stabilize the migrant crisis by utilizing the EGF.<sup>234</sup> Meanwhile, the inadequate EU support for Italy with the migrant crisis could have been remedied through the EUROGENDFOR, a useful tool at the EU’s disposal to address the migrant crisis.<sup>235</sup> According to EUROGENDFOR, “the European Gendarmerie Force, relying on more than 360,000 police officers throughout the European Union and reflecting the highest EU police standards, combines and benefits from the long experience of each of its members.”<sup>236</sup> The EGF was formed to participate in EU crisis stabilization efforts.

### **D. EUROPEAN UNION AND NATO**

According to Stefano Stefanini, a former permanent representative of Italy at NATO, “For now, Italy has to bite the bullet on immigration.”<sup>237</sup> Although the EU and NATO have provided support, the demands have been far greater on Italy than on many other EU and NATO countries. There are no signs of this situation abating. Stefanini also argues that “circumstances have changed and the EU has to adapt its rules

---

<sup>232</sup> “EUROGENDFOR Aim,” EUROGENDFOR, accessed on October 22, 2017, <http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/participating-forces/members>.

<sup>233</sup> Ibid.

<sup>234</sup> Ibid.

<sup>235</sup> “EUROGENDFOR Family,” EUROGENDFOR, accessed on October 22, 2017, <http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/participating-forces/members>.

<sup>236</sup> Ibid.

<sup>237</sup> Stefanini., 1.

accordingly.”<sup>238</sup> The rising number of migrants may complicate the challenge of human trafficking and organized crime within the Italian borders. The Carabinieri has law enforcement experience that may assist greatly with distinguishing asylum seekers from other migrants while building relationships inside Italy’s law enforcement community. The steps that the EU and NATO can initiate include keeping an open communication link with the Carabinieri and involving all European countries in the efforts to address Italy’s security challenges.

The Italian Carabinieri have historically had a strong foundation of public support and have been vigilant about making changes to deal with new security challenges. Although the Carabinieri is fully equipped and capable today, the future demands are visibly increasing with the influx of migrants, human trafficking, and organized crime. The Italian Carabinieri must continue to be trained, equipped, drilled, planned, and ready to meet the increased challenges, particularly in the Mediterranean. As in the past, gendarmeries such as the Carabinieri will contribute to finding solutions and implementing them in order to meet the contemporary security challenges facing Italy, Europe, and NATO.

---

<sup>238</sup> Ibid.

## LIST OF REFERENCES

- Alcaro, Riccardo. "The Italian Government and the Albright Report on NATO's New Strategic Concept." *Istitu Affari Internazionali* (2010): 1–8.
- Andel-Ajani, Asale. "A Question of Dangerous Races?" *SAGE Journal*. London 4, no. 5 (October 2003) New York: 433–449.
- Arbatova, Nadezhda. "Italy, Russia's Voice in Europe?" Russian/NIS Center, September 2011.  
<https://www.ifri.org/sites/default/files/atoms/files/ifrirusseitaliearbatovaengsept2011.pdf>.
- Baczynska, Gabriela. "EU Border Agency Sees 2017 Migrant Arrivals via Libya Same as Last Year." *Reuters*. February 15, 2017. <https://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-europe-migrants-eu/eu-border-agency-sees-2017-migrant-arrivals-via-libya-same-as-last-year-idUKKBN15U1HI>.
- Barigazzi, Jacopo. "Germany Rejects Italian Proposal to Open EU Ports to Migrants." *Politico*. July 6, 2017. <http://www.politico.eu/article/germany-rejects-italian-proposal-to-open-eu-ports-to-migrants/>.
- BBC News. "Why is Italy Seeing a Record Number of Migrants?" November 29, 2016. <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-38148110>.
- Bensalhia, John. "1814-2014: Carabinieri at 200." *Italy Magazine*, August 25, 2014.
- Brolan, Claire. "Analysis of Human Smuggling Trade and the Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Air and Sea (2000) from a Refugee Protection Perspective." *International Journal of Refugee Law* 14, no. 4 (October 2002): 561.
- Breines, Markus, Michael Collyer, Derek Lutterbeck, Cetta Mainwaring, Daniel Mainwaring and Paola Monzini, "A Study on Smuggling of Migrants," *European Commission*. no. 1 (September 2015): 1–179. [http://www.emn.lv/wp-content/uploads/study\\_on\\_smuggling\\_of\\_migrants\\_final\\_report\\_master\\_091115\\_final.pdf](http://www.emn.lv/wp-content/uploads/study_on_smuggling_of_migrants_final_report_master_091115_final.pdf).
- Brolan, Claire. "Analysis of Human Smuggling Trade and the Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Air and Sea (2000) from a Refugee Protection Perspective." *International Journal of Refugee Law* 14, no. 4 (October 2002): 561.

- Carabinieri. "The Carabinieri Force Has Taken Part." August 26, 2017, [http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/the-carabinieri-force-has-taken-part-\\_43a075ce89034912a7b402c8adb46daf](http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/the-carabinieri-force-has-taken-part-_43a075ce89034912a7b402c8adb46daf).
- . "Over the Past Ten Years the Traffic of Organized Crime." accessed March 6, 2017. [http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/over-the-past-ten-years-the-traffic-of-organized-crime-\\_d675dd4325cf45d385597078993d7054](http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/over-the-past-ten-years-the-traffic-of-organized-crime-_d675dd4325cf45d385597078993d7054).
- . "The History." October 9, 2017. <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/english/the-history>.
- Central Intelligence Agency. "The World Factbook: Italy." May 2, 2017. <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/>.
- Clingendael Netherlands Institute of International Relations. "The Position of Italy in Europe's Migration and Asylum Crisis." March 10, 2017. <https://www.clingendael.nl/publication/position-italy-europes-migration-and-asylum-crisis>.
- Conforti, Nicola. "The Italian Carabinieri Corps: Old Traditions for a Modern Vision," in *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, edited by Johannes Louis Hovens 227–239. Koninklijke Marechaussee, 2011.
- Constructed Worlds. "Carabinieri." August 26, 2017. <http://conworld.wikia.com/wiki/Carabinieri>.
- Coticchia, Fabrizio, and Giampero Giacomello, "Helping Hands: Civil-Military Cooperation and Italy's Military Operation Abroad," *Small Wars and Insurgencies*, 20, no. 3 (December 1999): 592–610.
- Daniels, Philip. "Italy in European Union." *Economic and Political Weekly* 33, no. 35 (1998): PE107-E112. [http://www.jstor.org/stable/4407131?seq=1#page\\_scan\\_tab\\_contents](http://www.jstor.org/stable/4407131?seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents).
- de Weger, Michiel J. *The Potential of the European Gendarmerie Force*. Netherlands Institute of International Relations: Clingendael Press, 2009.
- Di Camillo, Federica, and Lucia Marta. "National Security Strategies: The Italian Case." *Elcano Newsletter* 60 (2009): 33.
- Didier Bigo, "Migration and Security," in *Controlling a New Migration World*, edited by Virginie Guiraudon and Christian Joppke. New York: Routledge, 2001.
- Dinan, Desmond. *Europe Recast: A History of European Union*. Boulder, Colorado: Rienner Publishers, 2014.



- Donati, Silvia. "Carabinieri Recover Biggest Stolen Archeology Collection in History." *Italy Magazine*. January 22, 2015.  
<http://www.italymagazine.com/news/carabinieri-recover-biggest-stolen-archeology-collection-history>.
- Drent, Margriet, Rosa Dinnissen, Bibi van Ginkel, Hans Hogeboom, Kees Homan, Dick Zandee, Jan Rood, and Minke Meijnders. "The Relationship between External and Internal Security." (2014). <https://www.clingendael.nl>.
- Durden, Tyler. "European Migrant Crisis Escalates: Italy Impounds German NGO Refugee Ship." *ZeroHedge*. August 2, 2017.  
<http://www.zerohedge.com/news/2017-08-02/european-migrant-crisis-escalates-italy-impounds-german-ngo-refugee-ship>.
- EUROGENDFOR,. "EUROGENDFOR Aim," accessed on October 22, 2017,  
<http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/participating-forces/members>.
- . "EUROGENDFOR Family," accessed on October 22, 2017,  
<http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/participating-forces/members>.
- . "Members." February 28, 2017,  
<http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/participating-forces/members>.
- . "EUROGENDFOR Missions in Afghanistan." accessed March 5, 2017,  
<http://www.eurogendfor.org/eurogendfor-missions/eurogendfor-afghanistan>.
- . "EUROGENDFOR Missions in Mali." accessed March 5, 2017,  
<http://www.eurogendfor.org/eurogendfor-missions/eurogendfor-mali>.
- . "The European Gendarmerie Force." accessed October 11, 2017,  
<http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/what-is-eurogendfor>.
- . "What is EUROGENDFOR." February 28, 2017,  
<http://www.eurogendfor.org/organisation/what-is-eurogendfor>.
- European Commission. "How Does Frontex Joint Operation Triton Support Search and Rescue Operations?" April 1, 2015, [https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/what-we-do/policies/european-agenda-migration/background-information/docs/frontex\\_triton\\_factsheet\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/what-we-do/policies/european-agenda-migration/background-information/docs/frontex_triton_factsheet_en.pdf).
- European Institute for Asian Studies. "EU-Asia Migration Challenges: Countering People-Smuggling." May 10, 2016, [http://www.eias.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/EIAS\\_Event\\_Report\\_EU-Asia\\_Migration\\_Challenges\\_People\\_Smuggling\\_10.05.2016.pdf](http://www.eias.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/EIAS_Event_Report_EU-Asia_Migration_Challenges_People_Smuggling_10.05.2016.pdf).
- European Union. "History of European Union." January 28, 2017,  
[https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu\\_en](https://europa.eu/european-union/about-eu_en).

- EUROPOL. "EU Serious and Organised Crime Threat Assessment (SOCTA 2013)." April 29, 2013, <https://www.europol.europa.eu/activities-services/main-reports/eu-serious-and-organised-crime-threat-assessment-socta-2013>.
- . "Threat Assessment- Italian Organized Crime." June 2013, <https://www.europol.europa.eu/publications-documents/threat-assessment-italian-organised-crime>.
- Fabrizio, Eva. "The Geopolitical Importance of Eastern Europe for the European Union and Italy." *Geographic Slovenica* 34, no. 1 (2001): 91–103.
- Farrell, Nicolas. "Welcome to Italy: This is What a Real Immigration Crisis Looks Like." *The Spectator*. June 20, 2015. <http://www.spectator.co.uk/2015/06/the-invasion-of-italy>.
- Fillmore, Matthew. "Italy, the European Union, and Mediterranean Migrants: Opportunity from Crisis?" Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2016.
- Gobinet, Pierre. "The Gendarmerie Alternative: Is There a Case for the Police Organisations with Military Status in the Twenty-First Century European security Apparatus?" in the *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, edited by Johannes Louis Hovens 27–50. Koninklijke Marechaussee, 2011.
- . "The Need for Gendarmeries in the Years Ahead," *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, Koninklijke Marechaussee. October 2011. 83–294.
- Greener, Beth K., and William Fish. *Internal Security and Statebuilding: Aligning Agencies and Functions*. *Routledge Studies in Intervention and Statebuilding*. Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge, 2015.
- Gounev, Philip, and Tihomir Bezlov. "Examining the Links Between Organized Crime and Corruption," European Commission. 2010. [https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/doc\\_centre/crime/docs/study\\_on\\_links\\_between\\_oraganised\\_crime\\_and\\_corruption\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/sites/homeaffairs/files/doc_centre/crime/docs/study_on_links_between_oraganised_crime_and_corruption_en.pdf).
- Hovens, Hans. "The European Gendarmerie Force: Building the Public Security Gap?" in the *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, edited by Johannes Louis Hovens 130–166. Koninklijke Marechaussee, 2011.
- Hoogenboom, Bob. "Policing the Gap: the Growing Importance of Gendarmerie Forces in Creating National and International Stability." in *Gendarmeries and Security Challenges of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, edited Johannes Louis Hovens 97–119. Koninklijke Marechaussee, 2011).
- Kelley, Terrence et al., "A Stability Police Force for the United States, Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 2009.

- Kessler, Roy M. "Italian: Area Background Information." Master's thesis, Defense Language Institute, 1971.
- Krull, Jarrod. "Carabinieri, Faithful Over the Centuries." *SFOR Informer*. April 2004, <http://www.nato.int/sfor/indexinf/170/p07a/t02p07a.htm>.
- L'Arma de Carabinieri. "The Corps History." March 2, 2017. <http://home.mweb.co.za/re/redcap/carahist.htm>.
- Lindley-French, Julian (2004) "The Revolution in Security Affairs: Hard and Soft Security Dynamics in the 21st Century." *European Security* 13, no. 1 (2004): 1–15. DOI: 10.1080/09662830490484773.
- Lutterbeck, Derek, and Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces. 2013. *The Paradox of Gendarmeries: Between Expansion, Demilitarization and Dissolution*. SSR paper, 3. Geneva: DCAF.
- Lutterbeck, Derek. "Dr. Derek Lutterbeck," MEDVAC, University of Malta.
- Marleen, Monica Den Boer, Jelle Janssens, Tom Vander Beken, Rene Moelker. *Blurring Military and Policing Roles*. Hague, Netherlands: Eleven International Publishing, 2010.
- McNerney, Michael, Giacomo Persi Paoli, and Sarah Grand-Clement. "Cross-Cutting Challenges and Their Implications for the Mediterranean Region." RAND EUROPE. March 11, 2107. [http://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE200/PE222/RAND\\_PE222.pdf](http://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/perspectives/PE200/PE222/RAND_PE222.pdf)
- Menotti, Roberto. "NATO's Mediterranean Dialogue Initiative: Italian Positions, Interests, Perceptions, and the Implications for Italy-US relations." <http://www.nato.int/acad/fellow/97-99/menotti.pdf>.
- Military Gendarmerie. "The Main Tasks of the Military Gendarmerie." March 9, 2017. <http://zw.wp.mil.pl/en/205.html>.
- Ministero Della Difesa. "Because of the Pluralistic Nature of Public Law and Order Management." October 09, 2017, <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/organization/general-headquarters>.
- . "Carabinieri for the Protection of Cultural Heritage Anti-Counterfeiting." November 1, 2017. <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/english/carabinieri-for-the-protection-of-cultural-heritage-and-anti-counterfeiting>.
- . "Carabinieri General Headquarters." October 09, 2017. <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/organization/general-headquarters>.

- . “The Territorial Organization is at the Core of the Institute’s.” October 09, 2017. <http://www.carabinieri.it/multilingua/en/organization/general-headquarters>.
- . “Mare Nostrum Operation.” accessed October 12, 2017, <http://www.marina.difesa.it/EN/operations/Pagine/MareNostrum.aspx>.
- Ministry of Foreign Affairs. “Italy and Peacekeeping: Italian Missions for Peace in the World.” February 10, 2017. [http://www.esteri.it/MAE/doc\\_dossier/dossier\\_pc/dp\\_e.pdf](http://www.esteri.it/MAE/doc_dossier/dossier_pc/dp_e.pdf).
- Monaco, Francesca, and Tommaso De Zan, “Italy and NATO: What Defence?” *Istitu Affari Internazionali* 15, no.26 (December 2015).
- Munzi, Massimiliano. “Combating Human Trafficking along Migration Routes,” *CoESPU Magazine*, 2016, <http://www.carabinieri.it/docs/default-source/default-document-library/2016---n-2.pdf?sfvrsn=0>.
- NATO-OTAN. “Chairman of the Military Committee Praises Italy’s Contribution to NATO.” accessed March 1, 2017. [http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news\\_135849.htm?selectedLocale=en](http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news_135849.htm?selectedLocale=en).
- . “Italian Carabinieri Commanding General Visits Kosovo.” Accessed April 14, 2017, <http://jfcnaples.nato.int/kfor/media-center/archive/news/2017/italian-carabinieri-commanding-general-visits-kosovo>.
- . “Italian Carabinieri Train Nearly 9000 Members of Iraqi Federal Police.” NATO-OTAN. Accessed October 12, 2017, [http://www.nato.int/cps/en/SID-9EB8A162-F446F878/natolive/news\\_65939.htm](http://www.nato.int/cps/en/SID-9EB8A162-F446F878/natolive/news_65939.htm).
- . “Secretary General in Rome: Italy is a Driving Force within NATO.” accessed March 1, 2017. [http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news\\_131453.htm](http://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/news_131453.htm).
- . “NATO Summit Guide.” July 9, 2016, [http://www.nato.int/nato\\_static\\_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf\\_2016\\_07/20160715\\_1607-Warsaw-Summit-Guide\\_2016\\_ENG.pdf](http://www.nato.int/nato_static_fl2014/assets/pdf/pdf_2016_07/20160715_1607-Warsaw-Summit-Guide_2016_ENG.pdf).
- Oakley, Robert B., Michael J. Dziedzic, and Eliot M. Goldberg, *Policing the New World Disorder Peace Operations and Public Security*. Washington, DC: Defense National University Press, 1998.
- Palumbo, Letizia. “Demand in the Context of Trafficking in Human Beings in the Domestic Work Sector in Italy.” European Commission, June 2016.

- Panebianco, Stefania. "The Mare Nostrum Operation and the SAR approach: the Italian Response to the Address the Mediterranean Migrant Crisis." EUMedEA. March 2016, [http://www.dsps.unict.it/sites/default/files/files/panebianco\\_EUMedEA\\_JMWP\\_03-2016.pdf](http://www.dsps.unict.it/sites/default/files/files/panebianco_EUMedEA_JMWP_03-2016.pdf). 1–31.
- Pasqualini, Maria Gabriella. "The Italian Carabinieri Corps Abroad: Combat and Crowd Control in a Special Professionalism," BazHam (2006). 77–101.
- Pugh, Michael Charles. *Europe's Boat People: Maritime Cooperation in the Mediterranean*. Paris: Institute for Security Studies, Western Union, 2000. <http://www.iss.europa.eu/uploads/media/cp0>.
- Renzi, Matteo. "The Mediterranean Migrant Emergency is Not Italy's. It Is Europe's." *The Guardian*. June 23, 2015.
- Reuters, Thomson. "The Migration Problem in Italy is Getting Completely Out of Control." *Business Insider*, November 15, 2016. <http://www.businessinsider.com/r-as-asylum-seekers-clog-italys-courts-europe-is-no-help-2016-11>.
- Scherer, Steve. "The Migration Problem in Italy is Getting Completely out of control." *Business Insider*. November 15, 2016.
- Sebastian, Sofia. "The Role of Police in UN Peace Operations," *Civilians in Conflict*, September 2015, [https://www.stimson.org/sites/default/files/file-attachments/CIC-Policy-Brief\\_3\\_Sept-2015-Web-REVISED\\_Jan2016\\_0.pdf](https://www.stimson.org/sites/default/files/file-attachments/CIC-Policy-Brief_3_Sept-2015-Web-REVISED_Jan2016_0.pdf).
- Stefanini, Stefano. "The EU Can't Solve Italy's Migration Crisis." *Politico*. July 31, 2017. <http://www.politico.eu/article/eu-cant-solve-italy-migration-crisis-refugees-mediterranean-sea/>.
- The Local*. "Police Orders Dozens of Migrants to Move from Milan Station." May 3, 2017, <https://www.thelocal.it/20170503/dozens-of-migrants-moved-from-milan-station>.
- UNICRI. "Organized Crime and the Legal Economy: The Italian Case." April 27, 2016, [http://www.unicri.it/in\\_focus/on/Organized\\_Crime\\_Legal\\_Economy](http://www.unicri.it/in_focus/on/Organized_Crime_Legal_Economy).
- U.S. Department of State. "2016 Trafficking in Report." March 10, 2017. <https://www.state.gov/j/tip/rls/tiprpt/countries/2016/258790.htm>.
- Wertman, Douglas A. "Italian Foreign Policy in the 1980s: What Kind of Role?" *SAIS Review* 2, no. 4 (1982): 115–125. <https://muse.jhu.edu>.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

## **INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST**

1. Defense Technical Information Center  
Ft. Belvoir, Virginia
2. Dudley Knox Library  
Naval Postgraduate School  
Monterey, California